

# Council Meeting AGENDA NO. 4/17

# Meeting Date:Tuesday 23 May 2017Location:Council Chambers, Level 1A, 1 Pope Street, RydeTime:7.00pm

Council Meetings will be recorded on audio tape for minute-taking purposes as authorised by the Local Government Act 1993. Council Meetings will also be webcast.

#### NOTICE OF BUSINESS

#### ltem

#### Page

1	CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Council Meeting held on 26 April	1
2	2017 REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE	
3	MEETING 4/17 held on 9 May 2017 REPORT OF THE RYDE CIVIC HUB COMMITTEE MEETING 4/17	51
5	held on 9 May 2017	55
4	REPORT OF THE WORKS AND COMMUNITY COMMITTEE	
_	MEETING 3/17 held on 16 May 2017	59
5	REPORT OF THE FINANCE AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE	~~
6	MEETING 4/17 held on 16 May 2017 RYDE YOUTH THEATRE: UPDATE ON INVESTIGATIONS INTO	60
0	ALTERNATE FUNDING SOURCES	61
7	BLENHEIM PARK - UPDATE AND STATUS - PROPERTY	
	ACQUISITIONS	88
PRE	CIS OF CORRESPONDENCE	
1	EASTWOOD COMMUTER CARPARK	97
2	AUDIT OFFICE OF NEW SOUTH WALES - INITIAL LOCAL	
	GOVERNMENT PERFORMANCE AUDITS	99
ΝΟΤ	ICES OF MOTION	
1	CHRISTIE PARK AMENITIES BUILDING - Councillor Roy Maggio 1	109
2	INDEPENDENT HEARING AND ASSESSMENT PANEL (IHAP) -	
3	Councillor Roy Maggio 1 STRENGTHENING PROCEDURES – INTERACTIONS BETWEEN	109
3	COUNCILLORS AND DEVELOPERS - Councillor Roy Maggio 1	109
QUE	STIONS BY COUNCILLORS AS PER POLICY	

1 QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE - Councillor Jeff Salvestro-Martin	110
--	-----



# 1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Council Meeting held on 26 April 2017

Report prepared by: Senior Coordinator - Governance File No.: CLM/17/1/1/2 - BP17/468

#### **REPORT SUMMARY**

In accordance with Council's Code of Meeting Practice, a motion or discussion with respect to such minutes shall not be in order except with regard to their accuracy as a true record of the proceedings.

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

That the Minutes of the Council Meeting 3/17, held on 26 April 2017 be confirmed.

#### ATTACHMENTS

1 MINUTES - Ordinary Council Meeting - 26 April 2017



Council Reports Page 2

# **ITEM 1 (continued)**

# ATTACHMENT 1

# Council Meeting MINUTES OF MEETING NO. 3/17

# Meeting Date:Wednesday 26 April 2017Location:Council Chambers, Level 1A, 1 Pope Street, RydeTime:7.00pm

**Councillors Present:** The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM.

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Maggio arrived at the meeting at 7.40pm. He was not present for the consideration and voting on Public Participation on Items Listed on the Agenda and a Matter of Urgency.

Apologies: Councillor Li.

**Staff Present:** Acting General Manager, Acting Director – Customer and Community Services, Acting Director – Corporate and Organisational Support Services, Acting Director – City Planning and Development, Director – City Works and Infrastructure, General Counsel, Acting Chief Financial Officer, Acting Manager – Communications, Customer Service and Events, Manager – Risk, Audit and Governance, Acting Manager – City Planning, Manager – Community Services, Manager – Asset Systems, Acting Manager – Strategic Human Resources, Executive Officer – Ryde Civic Hub, Development Contributions Coordinator, Senior Coordinator – Community Engagement, Senior Coordinator – Governance, Governance, Risk and Audit Coordinator and Administration Officer – Councillor Support.

#### <u>PRAYER</u>

Reverend Mal York of West Ryde Anglican Church, was present and offered prayer prior to the commencement of the meeting.

#### **DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST**

Councillor Laxale disclosed a Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in Item 2 – Report of the Planning and Environment Committee Meeting 3/17 held on 11 April 2017 for the reasons that an objector is known to him.

Councillor Simon disclosed a Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in Item 2 – Report of the Planning and Environment Committee Meeting 3/17 held on 11 April 2017 for the reasons that he is a friend and party colleague of Penny Pedersen, who was an objector on this matter.

# ATTACHMENT 1

Councillor Pendleton disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in Item 3 – Report of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting 3/17 held on 11 April 2017 for the reason that her continued and consistent opposition to the sale/redevelopment of the Civic Centre public land with the inclusion of high rise residential development, the loss of the bus interchange and internal auditorium and other community amenity is consistent with her core commitment made to the electorate at the 2012 elections.

Councillor Laxale disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in Item 4(3) – Community Grants Program – Allocation of Funding 2016/2017 for the reason that senior members of the Eastwood St Andrews Football Club and Macquarie Chapel are known to him.

Councillor Yedelian OAM disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in Item 4(3) – Community Grants Program – Allocation of Funding 2016/2017 for the reason that he is on the Board of one of the organisations applying and knows the son of another organisation.

# TABLING OF PETITIONS

No Petitions were tabled.

#### PRESENTATION OF AWARD – LOCAL GOVERNMENT EXCELLENCE AWARDS, LOCAL GOVERNMENT PROFESSIONALS NSW – "DESIGN OUR RYDE"

The Mayor, Councillor Pickering advised the meeting that at the Local Government Awards Ceremony held on 6 April 2017, the City of Ryde was presented with a Highly Commended Award in the category of "Excellence in Innovation, Leadership and Management" for the "Design Our Ryde" project.

This category recognises innovative projects that demonstrate new ways of leading, facilitating, administering, controlling or ensuring a particular outcome is achieved, and positive changes to the leadership and management of councils, processes, practices and projects are made.

The Mayor, Councillor Pickering thanked all staff involved in the project for their efforts, particularly Council's Executive Officer – Ryde Civic Hub (Malcolm Harrild) and Council's Senior Coordinator – Community Engagement (Claudia Micallef).

#### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ITEMS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

The following persons addressed the Council:-

Name	Торіс
Gavin Carrier	<b>ITEM 6 – CONFIDENTIAL</b> – Draft Voluntary Planning Agreement with Holdmark – 66 – 82 Talavera Road,
	Macquarie Park

Agenda of the Council Meeting No. 4/17, dated Tuesday 23 May 2017.

# ATTACHMENT 1

# PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ITEMS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

Note: Councillor Maggio was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Salvestro-Martin)

That the speakers who submitted a Request to Address Council on Items Listed on the Agenda on an Item previously considered by the Planning and Environment Committee Meeting 3/17 held on 11 April 2017 be allowed to address the meeting, the time being 7.20pm.

# Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

# PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ITEMS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

The following persons then addressed the Council:-

Name	Торіс
Gavin Carrier	ITEM 2(3) – 66 – 82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park
	<ul> <li>Amendment to the Gateway Determination</li> </ul>
Michael Harrison	ITEM 2(3) – 66 – 82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park
	<ul> <li>Amendment to the Gateway Determination</li> </ul>

# PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ITEMS NOT LISTED ON THE AGENDA

Name	Торіс
Paul Azizi (representing	Blenheim Park Expansion
Raymond Azizi)	

# MATTER OF URGENCY

Councillor Stott advised that she wished to raise a Matter of Urgency regarding Misleading and Damaging Information available on Council Website.

The Mayor, Councillor Pickering accepted this matter as an Urgent Item.

Note: Councillor Maggio was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Salvestro-Martin)

That Council consider a Matter of Urgency raised by Councillor Stott regarding Misleading and Damaging Information available on Council Website, the time being 7.36pm.

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

# **Record of the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillor Maggio arrived to the meeting at 7.40pm.

# MATTER OF URGENCY – MISLEADING AND DAMAGING INFORMATION AVAILABLE ON COUNCIL WEBSITE

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Salvestro-Martin)

That the speech made by Chris Turner at the Council Meeting held on Tuesday, 28 March 2017 be removed from the Council website until those Councillors who wish to obtain legal advice regarding the statements have had time to have their legal representatives give that advice.

On being put to the Meeting, Councillor Perram abstained from the voting and accordingly his vote was recorded Against the Motion.

# Record of the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Perram and Simon

# MATTER OF URGENCY

Councillor Salvestro-Martin advised that he wished to raise a Matter of Urgency regarding matters raised by a speaker, Mr Paul Azizi earlier in the meeting.

The Mayor, Councillor Pickering accepted this matter as an Urgent Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Maggio)

That Council consider a Matter of Urgency raised by Councillor Salvestro-Martin regarding matters raised by a speaker, Mr Paul Azizi earlier in the meeting, the time being 8.01pm.

# Record of the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Perram and Simon

#### ATTACHMENT 1

# MATTER OF URGENCY – MATTERS RAISED BY A SPEAKER, MR PAUL AZIZI EARLIER IN THE MEETING

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Maggio)

That following the public address by Mr Paul Azizi earlier in the meeting, that the Acting General Manager prepare a report to be presented back to Council regarding the issues raised.

#### **Record of the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### MAYORAL MINUTES

# MM5/17 JURDS LANE - The Mayor, Councillor Bill Pickering

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Yedelian OAM)

That a report, including legal, financial and operational implications, be presented to Council as soon as possible, in identifying all options available to Council in this matter.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### ORDER OF BUSINESS

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

That Council now consider the following Item, the time being 8.14pm:-

 Item 2(3) – 66 – 82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park – Amendment to the Gateway Determination

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

# **COUNCIL REPORTS**

#### 2 REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE MEETING 3/17 held on 11 April 2017

- <u>Note</u>: Councillor Laxale disclosed a Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reasons that an objector is known to him. He left the meeting at 8.15pm and was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.
- <u>Note</u>: Councillor Simon disclosed a Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reasons that he is a friend and party colleague of Penny Pedersen, who was an objector on this matter. He left the meeting at 8.15pm and was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Stott)** 

That Council determine Item 3 of the Planning and Environment Committee report 3/17, held on 11 April 2017 noting that Items 1 and 2 were dealt with by the Committee within its delegated powers.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillors Laxale and Simon returned to the meeting at 8.16pm.

#### 3 66 - 82 TALAVERA ROAD MACQUARIE PARK - AMENDMENT TO THE GATEWAY DETERMINATION

- Note: Gavin Carrier and Michael Harrison addressed the meeting in relation to this Item.
- <u>Note</u>: A Memorandum from the Acting Director City Planning and Development dated 24 April 2017 was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.
- Note: An A3 document with photographs from Gavin Carrier was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Stott)

That consideration of this matter be deferred to Closed Confidential Session.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Perram

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ITEMS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Salvestro-Martin)

That Council allow Mr Sarkis Nassif from Holdmark to address the meeting in relation to Item 2(3) - 66-82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park – Amendment to the Gateway Determination, the time being 8.21pm.

# Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Perram

# PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ITEMS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

The following person then addressed the Council:-

Name	Торіс	
Sarkis Nassif	ITEM 2(3) – 66 – 82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Par	
	- Amendment to the Gateway Determination	

#### COUNCIL REPORTS

1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Council Meeting held on 28 March 2017 RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

That the Minutes of the Council Meeting 2/17, held on 28 March 2017 be confirmed.

# Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

# 3 REPORT OF THE RYDE CIVIC HUB COMMITTEE MEETING 3/17 held on 11 April 2017

Note: Councillor Pendleton disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reason that her continued and consistent opposition to the sale/redevelopment of the Civic Centre public land with the inclusion of high rise residential development, the loss of the bus interchange and internal auditorium and other community amenity is consistent with her core commitment made to the electorate at the 2012 elections.

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

That Council determine all Items 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting 3/17, held on 11 April 2017 in accordance with the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Terms of Reference.

# Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

# 1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting held on 14 March 2017

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

That the Minutes of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee 2/17, held on 14 March 2017, be confirmed.

# Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

# 2 RYDE CIVIC HUB INTERNATIONAL DESIGN COMPETITION STATUS REPORT 17 - APRIL 2017

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Salvestro-Martin)

- (a) That the Committee receives and notes the content of this report.
- (b) That Council endorse the allocation of \$40,000 (including GST) to undertake traffic survey analysis to respond to the Roads and Maritime Service's intention to close one of the right hand turn lanes on Devlin Street into Blaxland Road and Parkes Street for conversion into a northbound traffic lane.
- (c) That the allocation of \$40,000, as per part (b) of this recommendation, be funded from Council's Available Working Capital and included in the March 2017 Quarterly Review.

On being put to the Meeting, Councillor Pendleton abstained from the voting and accordingly her vote was recorded Against the Motion.

# Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Pendleton, Simon and Laxale

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# 3 RYDE CIVIC HUB - CIVIC HALL MAINTENANCE UPDATE

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

- (a) That Council note the details of the maintenance options detailed in this report for the Civic Hall.
- (b) That Council allocate \$150,000 as a contingency amount for essential maintenance works for the Civic Hall, including the Civic Hall's roof and floor, as detailed in this report, funded from Council's Asset Replacement Reserve.

# **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### 4 CONFIDENTIAL - RYDE CIVIC HUB - CIVIC HALL ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS

**MOTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Salvestro-Martin)

- (a) That Council provide 'in principle' support for the Ryde Bowling Club site to be the preferred site to locate the Civic Hall replacement.
- (b) That the Acting General Manager be authorised to undertake further investigations and meetings with key stakeholders to confirm that this site is viable.
- (c) That an update report be submitted back to the Ryde Civic Hub Committee in July 2017.

**AMENDMENT:** (Moved by Councillors Perram and Maggio)

- (a) That the Acting General Manager be authorised to undertake further investigations and meetings with key stakeholders to confirm that the Ryde Bowling Club site is viable.
- (b) That an update report be submitted back to the Ryde Civic Hub Committee in July 2017.
- (c) That a redacted version of this report be made publicly available.

On being put to the Meeting, Councillor Stott abstained from the voting and accordingly her vote was recorded Against the Motion.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Amendment was six (6) for and three (3) against. The Amendment was **CARRIED** and then became the Motion.

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Amendment</u>: Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin and Yedelian OAM

Against the Amendment: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Simon and Stott

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Perram and Maggio)

- (a) That the Acting General Manager be authorised to undertake further investigations and meetings with key stakeholders to confirm that the Ryde Bowling Club site is viable.
- (b) That an update report be submitted back to the Ryde Civic Hub Committee in July 2017.
- (c) That a redacted version of this report be made publicly available.

On being put to the Meeting, Councillor Stott abstained from the voting and accordingly her vote was recorded Against the Motion.

# **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Simon and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Stott

#### 5 CONFIDENTIAL - RYDE CIVIC HUB - ECONOMIC ANALYSIS AND VIABILITY OF THE WINNING DESIGN

MOTION: (Moved by Councillor Stott and The Mayor, Councillor Pickering)

- (a) That Council received and notes the contents of this report.
- (b) That Council note the three (3) viable options, as detailed in this report.
- (c) That Council requests the Acting General Manager to seek a quotation and confirmation from the Beijing Institute of Architectural Design to assess and determine, if the viable options detailed in this report, can be made consistent with their winning design concept.
- (d) That Council note that an approach will now be made to the State Government to explore the opportunity for financial support for the development of this site.



**AMENDMENT**: (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Simon)

- (a) That Council notes that there is no viable option to build Design 572, noting this was the winning design of the International Design Competition.
- (b) That Council notes that the International Design Competition cost approximately \$1 million.
- (c) That the Mayor, Councillor Pickering release a statement noting the failure of the design competition and he apologies on behalf of the Council for wasting ratepayer funds.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Amendment was four (4) for and five (5) against. The Amendment was **LOST**. The Motion was then put and **CARRIED**.

# **Record for the Voting:**

For the Amendment: Councillors Laxale, Simon, Pendleton and Perram

<u>Against the Amendment</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillor Stott and The Mayor, Councillor Pickering)

- (a) That Council received and notes the contents of this report.
- (b) That Council note the three (3) viable options, as detailed in this report.
- (c) That Council requests the Acting General Manager to seek a quotation and confirmation from the Beijing Institute of Architectural Design to assess and determine, if the viable options detailed in this report, can be made consistent with their winning design concept.
- (d) That Council note that an approach will now be made to the State Government to explore the opportunity for financial support for the development of this site.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Perram and Simon



# **ATTACHMENT 1**

#### 4 REPORT OF THE WORKS AND COMMUNITY COMMITTEE MEETING 2/17 held on 18 April 2017

- <u>Note</u>: Councillor Yedelian OAM left the meeting at 9.22pm and was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.
- <u>Note</u>: Councillor Salvestro-Martin left the meeting at 9.22pm and was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

That Council determine Item 3 of the Works and Community Committee report 2/17, held on 18 April 2017 noting that Items 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 were dealt with by the Committee within its delegated powers.

#### Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

# 3 COMMUNITY GRANTS PROGRAM - ALLOCATION OF FUNDING 2016/2017

- <u>Note</u>: Councillor Laxale disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reason that senior members of the Eastwood St Andrews Football Club and Macquarie Chapel are known to him.
- <u>Note</u>: Councillor Yedelian OAM disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reason that he is on the Board of one of the organisations applying and knows the son of another organisation. He was note present for consideration or voting on this Item.
- <u>Note</u>: Councillor Salvestro-Martin was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.
- Note: Councillor Simon left the meeting at 9.25pm and was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)** 

(a) That Council endorse the allocation of the 2016/2017 City of Ryde Sports and Recreation Community Grant Category as follows:

Organisation	Project Name	Amount \$
Eastwood Ryde Netball Association Inc.	"L" to play Netball	3,500

#### Council Reports Page 14

# ITEM 1 (continued)

ATTACHMENT 1

Gladesville Sharks Football Club	Coaching for Junior Players-Boys & Girls	1,000
Putney Rangers Football Club	Equipment and coaching aids	3,327
Macquarie Combined Sports Club Incorporated – Macquarie Dragons FC	Equipment - noncompetitive football skills development	3,240
Eastwood St Andrews Association Football Club Inc.	Community Inclusion Program	2,000
Ryde Sports Foundation Inc.	Ryde Sports Foundation Personal Development Scholarship	3,500
	Total	16,567

(b) That Council endorse the allocation of the 2016/2017 City of Ryde Seniors Grant Category as follows:

Organisation	Project Name	Amount \$
Italian Leisure Group	Social Events	2,000
Catholic Healthcare Limited- Korean Day Centre	Special Art and Craft Day	1,752
Italo-Australian Senior Citizens Association	Italo-Australian Senior Citizens Group	2,000
Indonesian Welfare Association Incorporated	2B Active Seniors	2,000
Ryde Multicultural Centre Incorporated	Active and Informed Seniors 2017	2,000
Probus Club Of Ryde	Subsidize Transportation and Excursion Costs	2,000
Italian Women's Group Marsfield	Promotes Health Initiatives	500
	Total	12,252

(c) That Council endorse the allocation of the 2016/2017 City of Ryde Capacity Building Grant – Event Category as follows:

Organisation	Project Name	Amount \$
Reach Community Initiatives Incorporated	Community Christmas Dinner	3,000
Sydney Latin American Film Festival Inc.	Human Rights in Latin America Film Festival	2,000

l (continued)	ATTACHMENT 1	
Rotary Club of North Ryde Inc.	Seniors Christmas Party	1,250
Rotary Club Of Macquarie Park Incorporated	Light Up East Ryde	3,500
Macquarie Chapel Presbyterian Church	Downtown Bethlehem	2,700
Eastwood Chinese Senior Citizens Inc.	Lunar New Year Celebration Luncheon (Year of Dog)	1,000
Australian Asian Association of Bennelong and Eastwood Chinese Senior Citizens Club	2018 Harmony Soccer Tournament	1,000
Language Festival Association	Ryde Language Festival 2017	1,000
	Total	15,450

(d) That Council endorse the allocation of the 2016/2017 City of Ryde Capacity Building Grant – Emerging/Small Groups Category as follows:

Organisation	Organisation Support	Amount \$
Australia Han In Saenng Myung Line Inc Korean Life Line	Need financial assistance to maintain counseling service by telephone for Korean speaking community	3,500
Differently Abled People Association Incorporated- Friends of DAPA	The Friends of DAPA assist the organization to develop a smartphone app that helps disabled people to be independent in Australia	3,500
The Northern Centre - Together We Can	It is a support group for single mums from Korean speaking background	3,500
	Total	10,500

That Council endorse the allocation of the 2016/2017 City of Ryde Capacity (e) Building Grant – General Category as follows:

Organisation	Project Name	Amount \$
Ryde Hunters Hill Community Transport Association Inc.	Future Capability Training	1,129
Australia Korean Art Therapy Association Inc.	Therapist Member Trainings	2,850
SydneySiders Mens Barbershop Chorus Inc.	SydneySiders Express Men's Chorus Open Night	2,600

ITEM

1 (continued)	ATTACHMENT 1	
Friends Of Lane Cove National Park	Capacity building, train the team leaders Friends of Lane Cove National Park	3,480
Artisans Ryde Inc.	Artisans Ryde Classes	2,180
North Ryde Community Aid And Information Centre Inc.	Timebanking	3,500
The Ryde Chinese Carers Support Group	Becoming the most supportive CALD Carers support group	3,000
	Total	18,739

(f) That That Council endorse the allocation of the 2016/2017 City of Ryde Community Projects Grant Category as follows:

Organisation	Project Name	Amount \$
The Shepherd Centre - For Deaf Children	Ready Set Go A School Readiness Program for Children from Ryde who are Deaf or Hearing Impaired	3,400
Christian Community Aid - art4connection	art4connection Workshop	2,500
The Northern Centre	Tuning into Kids	4,952
St Andrews Socio Religious Justice, Harmony of FITA Inc.	Community Volunteering Training Project-Environment for Ryde Community	2,000
Buddhist Compassion and Relief Tzu Chi Foundation	Zero waste Ryde	4,000
Sydney Korean Women's Association Inc	Project Helping Hand	2,000
Northside Community Forum Limited	Care Support training for DARTS Bus drivers and DARTS Volunteers	5,000
Armenian Relief Society Araz Chapter	Self-Sustainability	2,500
Multicultural Integration Community Support	Old New Stories from abroad: A film project with aging immigrants	3,300
Taldumande Youth Services	Intensive Family Support Program	5,000
Feng Huang Yuan Spiritual Cultivation Centre Inc.	Restore Ways to Health and Wellness	3,500
	Total	38,152

- (g) That the grant applicants be informed in writing of the outcome of their applications.
- (h) That \$38,400 being the remainder of the funding unallocated from current Grant round is transferred into the Community Grant Reserve Fund.



# ATTACHMENT 1

(i) That the Community Grant Reserve Fund which currently consists of \$35,290 be accumulated to \$73,690, and that this funding is to be utilised in providing Small Grants funding through the year.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillor Yedelian OAM returned to the meeting at 9.26pm.

#### 5 REPORT OF THE FINANCE AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE MEETING 3/17 held on 18 April 2017

<u>Note</u>: Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Simon were not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillor Maggio and The Mayor, Councillor Pickering)

That Council determine all Items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 and 11 of the Finance and Governance Committee Meeting 3/17, held on 18 April 2017 in accordance with the Finance and Governance Committee Terms of Reference.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Laxale

#### 1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Finance and Governance Committee Meeting held on 21 March 2017

<u>Note</u>: Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Simon were not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

That the Minutes of the Finance and Governance Committee 2/17, held on 21 March 2017, be confirmed.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillor Simon returned to the meeting at 9.28pm.

#### ATTACHMENT 1

# 2 INVESTMENT REPORT - March 2017

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Salvestro-Martin was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Yedelian OAM)

That Council endorse the Investment Report – March 2017.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### 3 DRAFT 2017/2021 FOUR YEAR DELIVERY PLAN INCLUDING DRAFT 2017/2018 ONE YEAR OPERATIONAL PLAN

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Salvestro-Martin was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

- (a) That Council, pursuant to Sections 404 and 405 of the Local Government Act 1993, endorse the document titled "Draft Four-Year Delivery Plan 2017/2021 including One-Year Operational Plan 2017/2018", inclusive of the 2017/2018 Draft Budget, Fees and Charges and Capital Works Program and as detailed in this report.
- (b) That the Draft Four-Year Delivery Plan 2017/2021 including One-Year Operational Plan 2017/2018 be publicly exhibited for a period of not less than 28 days from 2 May 2017 to 30 May 2017.
- (c) That following the public exhibition period detailed in part (b), Council consider all public submissions at its meeting to be held on Tuesday, 20 June 2017 prior to formally adopting its Four-Year Delivery Plan 2017/2021 including the One-Year Operational Plan 2017/2018.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

# 4 COUNCIL'S SUBSIDIES AND DISCOUNTS IN SERVICES AS AT 30 JUNE 2016

Note: Councillor Salvestro-Martin was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Yedelian OAM)

- (a) That Council note the current estimated Community Service Obligation (CSO) provided by the City of Ryde through its Fees and Charges is \$11.67 million;
- (b) That Council note the estimated total annual Community Service Obligations (CSOs), including cost shifting costs, CSOs from Fees and Charges and other sponsorships, community grants and subsidies provided by the City of Ryde and as detailed in the report, is estimated at \$20.56 million annually.
- (c) That Council maintain the current level of Community Service Obligations across its operations for the 2017/18 financial year.
- (d) That Council endorse Option 1, as outlined in this report, with respect to improving the level of CSO's as they relate to Council's fee related services.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillor Salvestro-Martin returned to the meeting at 9.30pm.

#### 5 STRENGTHENING RYDE - Update March 2017

**RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)** 

- (a) That Council note the progress and status of each project within the Strengthening Ryde initiative.
- (b) That Council note any ongoing initiatives will be reported to Council separately.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Laxale

# 6 PAYMENT PORTAL AND PAYMENT GATEWAY eBUSINESS PROJECT - UPDATE ON NEGOTIATIONS AND WAY FORWARD

Note: Councillor Stott left the meeting at 9.31pm and was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

<u>Note</u>: A Memorandum from the Acting Director – Corporate and Organisational Support Services dated 20 April 2017 was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Yedelian OAM)

- (a) That Council endorse the Technology One eServices solution as its preferred Payment Portal and Payment Gateway solution; and
- (b) That funding for the licencing and implementation of the Technology One eServices solution be sourced from the \$200,000 Council set aside for this project at its meeting of 24 November 2015.
- (c) That a further report be provided back to council on introducing a direct debit payment facility.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillor Stott returned to the meeting at 9.36pm.

# 7 COR-RFP-11/16 FOR THE MANAGEMENT AND OPERATION OF THE RYDE COMMUNITY AND SPORTS CENTRE

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Salvestro-Martin)

- (a) That pursuant to clause 178 (3) (e) of the Local Government (General) Regulation 2005 (**Regulation**):
  - (i) Council does not accept any of the tenders; and
  - (ii) Council enter into negotiations with any person (whether or not the person submitted a proposal) with a view to entering into a contract in relation to the management and operation of the Ryde Community and Sports Centre (RCSC) situated in ELS Hall Park.
- (b) That pursuant to clause 178 (4) of the Regulation, the Council's reasons for declining to invite fresh tenders or applications as referred to in resolution (a) (i) above and to enter into negotiations with any person, for the management and operation of the Ryde Community and Sports Centre are due to the minimal number of responses received and the resultant difficulties in the ability to adequately test the market.



# ATTACHMENT 1

- (c) That, if agreement is reached as a result of the negotiations referred to in resolution (a) (ii) above, the statutory advertising of the lease occur and should any written submissions objecting to the lease be received, a further report is to be provided to Council.
- (d) That subject to the requirements of resolution (c) above and (e) below, the Acting General Manager be delegated authority to enter into the negotiations referred to in resolution (a) (ii) above and to subsequently execute all relevant documents to effect any agreement that is reached with respect to those negotiations.
- (e) That a further report be provided to Council on the options for use of the synthetic turf sports field for community sports programs.
- (f) That all respondents are advised of Council's decision.

# **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### 8 COR-RFT-01/17 ELOUERA RESERVE PLAYGROUND AND LANDSCAPE WORKS

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

- (a) That Council accept the tender from Glascott Landscape and Civil for the Elouera Reserve Playground and Landscape Works to the amount of \$1,287,855.45 excluding GST as recommended in the Tender Evaluation Report.
- (b) That Council delegate to the General Manager the authority to enter into a contract with Glascott Landscape and Civil on the terms contained within the tender and for minor amendments to be made to the contract documents that are not of a material nature.
- (c) That Council advise all the respondents of Council's decision.

# **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

# 9 PROPERTY MATTER

**RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)** 

(a) That Council endorses the proposal to divest this surplus site;



#### ATTACHMENT 1

- (b) That, consistent with the recently adopted City-wide Property Strategy, net funds from this divestment are directed to the new Property Investment Fund (which is being established to support the Property Investment Portfolio); and
- (c) That the General Manager is delegated appropriate authority, as outlined in this report to undertake the divestment of the surplus property.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale and Simon

# **10 ADVICE ON COURT ACTIONS**

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Yedelian OAM)

That this Item be deferred to Closed Confidential Session for consideration.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### 11 CITY OF RYDE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ELECTION - 9 SEPTEMBER 2017

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

- (a) That Council allocate a budget of \$660,000, funded from the Election Reserve, for the conduct of the September 2017 Local Government Election.
- (b) That this adjustment be made as part of the draft 2017/2018 Operational Plan.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# LATE ITEMS

# 8 POSITION OF GENERAL MANAGER

**REOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Stott)

That Council determine its appointment of the Acting General Manager with the following delegation:-

Pursuant to s336(1) of the Local Government Act 1993, George Dedes be appointed to act in the position of General Manager, effective 18 May 2017 for a twelve (12) month period or until the appointment of a General Manager pursuant to s334 of the Local Government Act, whichever occurs first.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### 10 COUNCIL'S STANDING AND ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP -DISQUALIFICATION OF FORMER COUNCILLOR ARTIN ETMEKDJIAN

MOTION: (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Stott)

- (a) That Council note and endorse the proposed approach to be undertaken in relation to its Standing and Advisory Committees in respect of this matter.
- (b) That Council nominate Councillor Yedelian OAM as Chairperson, on the Economic Development Advisory Committee.
- (c) That Council nominate Councillor Maggio as the Deputy Chairperson, on the Economic Development Advisory Committee.

**AMENDMENT:** (Moved by Councillors Simon and Pendleton)

- (a) That Council note and endorse the proposed approach to be undertaken in relation to its Standing and Advisory Committees in respect of this matter.
- (b) That Council nominate Councillor Laxale as Chairperson, on the Economic Development Advisory Committee.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Amendment was four (4) for and five (5) against. The Amendment was **LOST**. The Motion was then put and **CARRIED**.

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# **Record for the Voting:**

For the Amendment: Councillors Laxale, Simon, Pendleton and Perram

<u>Against the Amendment</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Stott)

- (a) That Council note and endorse the proposed approach to be undertaken in relation to its Standing and Advisory Committees in respect of this matter.
- (b) That Council nominate Councillor Yedelian OAM as Chairperson, on the Economic Development Advisory Committee.
- (c) That Council nominate Councillor Maggio as the Deputy Chairperson, on the Economic Development Advisory Committee.

On being put to the Meeting, Councillor Pendleton abstained from the voting and accordingly her vote was recorded Against the Motion.

# **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Perram and Simon

# 11 DISQUALIFICATION OF FORMER COUNCILLOR ETMEKDJIAN – VACANCY IN CIVIC OFFICE

**MOTION:** (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Salvestro-Martin)

That Council endorse applying to the Minister for Local Government, in accordance with Section 294 of the Local Government Act, 1993 to not fill the vacancy in the West Ward as the vacancy is within 18 months before the next ordinary election of Councillors.

**AMENDMENT:** (Moved by Councillors Simon and Laxale)

(a) That Council endorse applying to the Minister for Local Government, in accordance with Section 294 of the Local Government Act, 1993 to not fill the vacancy in the West Ward as the vacancy is within 18 months before the next ordinary election of Councillors.



# **ATTACHMENT 1**

- (b) That the General Manager conduct an internal investigation into matters relating to Councillor and Council staff's knowledge of Councillor Etmekdjian's legal affairs. The investigation should include:
  - Whether Councillor Etmekdjian made any Councillors or council staff aware of the proceedings against him by the ATO?
  - Whether any Councillors or Council staff became aware of the proceedings against Councillor Etmekdjian including his guilty plea on 24 January 2017?
  - If any Councillors or Council Staff were aware of proceedings, what actions were taken to as a result of that knowledge?
- (c) That Council notes former Councillor Etmekdjian's support for an allowance for delegates to Sydney North Planning Panel and that Council moves to immediately cease the payment of this allowance to all Council delegates.
- (d) A full examination of all emails of Senior Staff and Councillors and City of Ryde Information Technology System/s in relation to this matter, with specific focus on any material that has been leaked to the media.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Amendment was four (4) for and five (5) against. The Amendment was **LOST**. The Motion was then put and **CARRIED**.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Amendment: Councillors Laxale, Simon, Pendleton and Perram

<u>Against the Amendment</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Salvestro-Martin)

That Council endorse applying to the Minister for Local Government, in accordance with Section 294 of the Local Government Act, 1993 to not fill the vacancy in the West Ward as the vacancy is within 18 months before the next ordinary election of Councillors.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# **COMPLETION OF BUSINESS**

<u>Note</u>: Councillors Laxale and Pendleton left the meeting at 10.59pm and were not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Stott)** 

That the meeting time be extended by 30 minutes to allow the completion of all business relating to this meeting, the time being 11.00pm.

#### Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Maggio

Note: Councillor Laxale returned to the meeting at 11.01pm.

# LATE PRECIS OF CORRESPONDENCE FOR CONSIDERATION

#### 1 LETTER FROM NORTH SYDNEY COUNCIL REGARDING LGNSW

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Pendleton was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

That the correspondence be received and noted and no action taken.

#### Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillor Pendleton returned to the meeting at 11.02pm.

#### NOTICES OF MOTION

#### 1 FORESHORE LIGHTING IN MEADOWBANK AND MEMORIAL PARK -Councillor Terry Perram

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Perram and Yedelian OAM)

(a) That Council take whatever steps are necessary to ensure that the foreshore lighting in Meadowbank and Memorial parks is operational at the times of day when it is required with a reliability no worse than that of any other safety lighting in the City of Ryde and that this be completed during the 2017/18 financial year.



# ATTACHMENT 1

- (b) That as an interim measure, Council arrange for weekly inspection of the foreshore lighting, approximately 45 minutes before sunrise, with prompt repair as necessary. When three consecutive weekly inspections demonstrate that all installed foreshore lights are operating, the frequency of inspection can be relaxed to monthly until the permanent solution resulting from a) above is operative.
- (c) That the results of each inspection in (b) above, be reported to Councillors through the next Councillors Information Bulletin following the inspection.

#### Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

# 2 COUNCILLOR MATTER - Councillor George Simon

**MOTION:** (Moved by Councillors Simon and Maggio)

- (a) That the General Manager conduct an internal investigation into matters relating to Councillor and Council staff's knowledge of Councillor Etmekdjian's legal affairs. The investigation should include:
  - Whether Councillor Etmekdjian made any Councillors or council staff aware of the proceedings against him by the ATO?
  - Whether any Councillors or Council staff became aware of the proceedings against Councillor Etmekdjian including his guilty plea on 24 January 2017?
  - If any Councillors or Council Staff were aware of proceedings, what actions were taken to as a result of that knowledge?
- (b) That Council notes former Councillor Etmekdjian's support for an allowance for delegates to Sydney North Planning Panel and that Council moves to immediately cease the payment of this allowance to all Council delegates.
- (c) That a full examination of all emails of Senior Staff and Councillors and City of Ryde Information Technology System/s in relation to this matter, with specific focus on any material that has been leaked to the media.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

That the Motion be dealt with in Seriatim.

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Perram, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin and Simon

Note: The Motion was then dealt with in Seriatim.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Simon and Maggio)

- (a) That the General Manager conduct an internal investigation into matters relating to Councillor and Council staff's knowledge of Councillor Etmekdjian's legal affairs. The investigation should include:
  - Whether Councillor Etmekdjian made any Councillors or council staff aware of the proceedings against him by the ATO?
  - Whether any Councillors or Council staff became aware of the proceedings against Councillor Etmekdjian including his guilty plea on 24 January 2017?
  - If any Councillors or Council Staff were aware of proceedings, what actions were taken to as a result of that knowledge?

# Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pickering, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Perram

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Simon and Maggio)

(b) That Council notes former Councillor Etmekdjian's support for an allowance for delegates to Sydney North Planning Panel and that Council moves to immediately cease the payment of this allowance to all Council delegates.

# **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin and Simon

<u>Against the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Stott and Yedelian OAM



# **ATTACHMENT 1**

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Simon and Maggio)

(c) That a full examination of all emails of Senior Staff and Councillors and City of Ryde Information Technology System/s in relation to this matter, with specific focus on any material that has been leaked to the media.

# **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Perram

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Simon and Maggio)

- (a) That the General Manager conduct an internal investigation into matters relating to Councillor and Council staff's knowledge of Councillor Etmekdjian's legal affairs. The investigation should include:
  - Whether Councillor Etmekdjian made any Councillors or council staff aware of the proceedings against him by the ATO?
  - Whether any Councillors or Council staff became aware of the proceedings against Councillor Etmekdjian including his guilty plea on 24 January 2017?
  - If any Councillors or Council Staff were aware of proceedings, what actions were taken to as a result of that knowledge?
- (b) That Council notes former Councillor Etmekdjian's support for an allowance for delegates to Sydney North Planning Panel and that Council moves to immediately cease the payment of this allowance to all Council delegates.
- (c) That a full examination of all emails of Senior Staff and Councillors and City of Ryde Information Technology System/s in relation to this matter, with specific focus on any material that has been leaked to the media.

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# **CLOSED SESSION**

# ITEM 6 - DRAFT VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT WITH HOLDMARK - 66-82 TALAVERA ROAD, MACQUARIE PARK

#### Confidential

This item is classified CONFIDENTIAL under Section 10A(2) of the Local Government Act, 1993, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: (c) information that would, if disclosed, confer a commercial advantage on a person with whom the Council is conducting (or proposes to conduct) business; AND (d) (i) commercial information of a confidential nature that would, if disclosed prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied it.

# ITEM 2(3) – 66-82 TALAVERA ROAD, MACQUARIE PARK – AMENDMENT TO THE GATEWAY DETERMINATION

#### Confidential

This item is classified CONFIDENTIAL under Section 10A(2) of the Local Government Act, 1993, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: (g) advice concerning litigation, or advice as comprises a discussion of this matter, that would otherwise be privileged from production in legal proceedings on the ground of legal professional privilege.

# ITEM 5(10) - ADVICE ON COURT ACTIONS

#### Confidential

This item is classified CONFIDENTIAL under Section 10A(2) of the Local Government Act, 1993, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: (g) advice concerning litigation, or advice as comprises a discussion of this matter, that would otherwise be privileged from production in legal proceedings on the ground of legal professional privilege.

#### ITEM 7 - OFFER TO ENTER INTO A VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT FROM GREENLAND TO EMBELLISH COMMUNITY FACILITY IN EXCHANGE FOR VEHICULAR ACCESS STRATUM UNDER JARVIS CIRCUIT LINKING LOTS 104 AND 105 IN DP 1224238 LACHLANS LINE, MACQUARIE PARK

# Confidential

This item is classified CONFIDENTIAL under Section 10A(2) of the Local Government Act, 1993, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: (c) information that would, if disclosed, confer a commercial advantage on a person with whom the Council is conducting (or proposes to conduct) business; AND (d) (i) commercial information of a confidential nature that would, if disclosed prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied it.

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# **ITEM 9 - STAFF MATTERS - SENIOR STAFF CONTRACTS**

#### Confidential

This item is classified CONFIDENTIAL under Section 10A(2) of the Local Government Act, 1993, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: (a) personnel matters concerning particular individuals (other than councillors).

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

That the Council resolve into Closed Session to consider the above matters.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

<u>Note</u>: The Council closed the meeting at 11.15pm. The public and media left the chamber.

#### **COUNCIL REPORTS - CONFIDENTIAL**

#### 6 DRAFT VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT WITH HOLDMARK - 66-82 TALAVERA ROAD, MACQUARIE PARK

Note: Gavin Carrier addressed the meeting in relation to this Item.

<u>Note</u>: Council's Solicitor (Chris Drury from Sparke Helmore) addressed the meeting in relation to this Item.

**MOTION:** (Moved by The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Salvestro-Martin)

- (a) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and subsequently exhibit the draft Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979; and execute the Voluntary Planning Agreement should there be no submissions during the exhibition period.
- (b) That the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement must include the following additional terms to those accepted by Council in its resolution of 26 July 2016;
  - i. Public Benefits to the value of \$160 million indexed annually (Sydney CPI), justified by valuations undertaken by Quantity Surveyors at Holdmark's cost;



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

ii. Sufficient securities as prescribed by Section 93F(3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Motion was two (2) for and seven (7) against. Councillor Stott abstained from the voting and accordingly her vote was recorded Against the Motion. The Motion was **LOST**.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Salvestro-Martin

<u>Against the Motion</u>: Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

**MOTION:** (Moved by Councillor Perram and Pendleton)

- (a) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and subsequently exhibit the draft Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979; and execute the Voluntary Planning Agreement should there be no submissions during the exhibition period.
- (b) That the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement must include the following additional terms to those accepted by Council in its resolution of 26 July 2016;
  - i. Public Benefits to the value of \$180 million indexed annually (Sydney CPI), being an increase of \$35 million, justified by valuations undertaken by Quantity Surveyors at Holdmark's cost;
  - ii. Sufficient securities as prescribed by Section 93F(3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Motion was four (4) for and five (5) against. Councillor Stott abstained from the voting and accordingly her vote was recorded Against the Motion. The Motion was **LOST**.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton and Perram

<u>Against the Motion</u>: Councillors Laxale, Salvestro-Martin, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM



# **ATTACHMENT 1**

**MOTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and The Mayor, Councillor Pickering)

- (a) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and subsequently exhibit the draft Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979; and execute the Voluntary Planning Agreement should there be no submissions during the exhibition period.
- (b) That the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement must include the following additional terms to those accepted by Council in its resolution of 26 July 2016;
  - i. Public Benefits to the value of not less than \$160 million, indexed annually (Sydney CPI), justified by valuations undertaken by Quantity Surveyors at Holdmark's cost;
  - ii. Sufficient securities as prescribed by Section 93F(3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Motion was two (2) for and seven (7) against. Councillors Stott and Yedelian OAM abstained from the voting and accordingly their votes were recorded Against the Motion. The Motion was **LOST**.

# Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Salvestro-Martin

<u>Against the Motion</u>: Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Simon, Stott and Yedelian OAM

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Stott left the meeting at 12.29am and was note present for the consideration or voting on this Item.

**MOTION:** (Moved by The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Pendleton)

(a) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and subsequently exhibit the draft Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979; and execute the Voluntary Planning Agreement should there be no submissions during the exhibition period.



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

- (b) That the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement must include the following additional terms to those accepted by Council in its resolution of 26 July 2016;
  - i. Public Benefits to the value of not less than \$180 million, indexed annually (Sydney CPI), justified by valuations undertaken by Quantity Surveyors at Holdmark's cost;
  - ii. Sufficient securities as prescribed by Section 93F(3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Motion was four (4) all. Councillor Yedelian OAM abstained from the voting and accordingly his vote was recorded Against the Motion. The Mayor, Councillor Pickering advised the meeting that he did not wish to use his Casting Vote in relation to this Motion. The Motion was **LOST**.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton and Perram

<u>Against the Motion</u>: Councillors Laxale, Salvestro-Martin, Simon and Yedelian OAM

#### **RECOMMITTAL**

Note: Councillor Stott was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Salvestro-Martin left the meeting at 12.34am and was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Pendleton and Perram)

That the Motion be Recommitted.

On being put to the meeting, Councillor Yedelian OAM abstained from the voting and accordingly his vote was recorded Against the Motion.

#### Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton and Perram

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Simon and Yedelian OAM

Note: The Motion was then Recommitted.



<u>Note</u>: Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Stott were not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Pendleton)

- (a) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and subsequently exhibit the draft Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979; and execute the Voluntary Planning Agreement should there be no submissions during the exhibition period.
- (b) That the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement must include the following additional terms to those accepted by Council in its resolution of 26 July 2016;
  - i. Public Benefits to the value of not less than \$180 million, indexed annually (Sydney CPI), justified by valuations undertaken by Quantity Surveyors at Holdmark's cost;
  - ii. Sufficient securities as prescribed by Section 93F(3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.

On being put to the meeting, Councillor Yedelian OAM abstained from the voting and accordingly his vote was recorded Against the Motion.

# **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Pendleton and Perram

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Simon and Yedelian OAM

<u>Note</u>: This matter was reconsidered by Council later in the Reconvened Council Meeting as detailed later in these Minutes.

Note: Councillor Stott returned to the meeting at 12.36am.

# 2 REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE MEETING 3/17 held on 11 April 2017

- 3 66 82 TALAVERA ROAD MACQUARIE PARK AMENDMENT TO THE GATEWAY DETERMINATION
- Note: Gavin Carrier and Michael Harrison addressed the meeting in relation to this Item.



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

- <u>Note</u>: A Memorandum from the Acting Director City Planning and Development dated 24 April 2017 was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.
- <u>Note</u>: An A3 document with photographs from Gavin Carrier was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.
- Note: Councillor Salvestro-Martin returned to the meeting at 12.38am.

**MOTION:** (Moved by The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Maggio)

- (a) That Council request that the Department of Planning and Environment amend the Gateway Determination issued in respect of 66 – 82 Talavera Road Macquarie Park to reflect the Council resolutions of 26 July 2016. Specifically the Gateway Determination conditions are to the be amended as follows:
  - GFA exclusion of 11,400sqm for affordable housing and a recreation centre.

<u>Amended to;</u>

• GFA exclusion of 8,796sqm for affordable housing and recreation facility.

<u>and;</u>

- Additional exclusion from GFA for 1,030 commercial car park spaces.
- (b) That Council;
  - i. does not support the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to exclude from GFA of any wind affected balcony from the calculation of FSR and;
  - ii. supports the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to specify a minimum of 20,000sqm of non-residential floor space be delivered on the site.
  - iii. Supports the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to increase the maximum height in the centre of the site from 120m to 154m.
- (c) That Council prepare a Development Control Plan for the property 66 82 Talavera Road and that a separate report be presented to Council on this matter.
- (d) That Council forward a request to the Department of Planning and Environment to amend the Gateway Determination in accordance with the above resolutions.



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

On being put to the meeting, the voting on the Motion was three (3) votes for and six (6) votes against. Councillors Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM abstained from the voting and accordingly their votes were recorded Against the Motion. The Motion was **LOST**.

## **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale and Simon

<u>Against the Motion</u>: Councillors Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

**MOTION:** (Moved by the Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Maggio)

That Council rescind its previous decision in respect of the Voluntary Planning Agreement (ITEM 6 on this Agenda) and defer consideration of the Planning Proposal, pending further advice from the Acting General Manager as to the outcome of further negotiations with Holdmark on both of these matters.

On being put to the meeting, the voting on the Motion was four (4) votes for and five (5) votes against. Councillor Salvestro-Martin abstained from the voting and accordingly his vote was recorded Against the Motion. The Motion was **LOST**.

## **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin and Simon

Note: The Matter is **AT LARGE**.

## **OPEN SESSION**

**MOTION:** (Moved by The Mayor Councillor Pickering and Councillor Stott)

That Council resolve itself into open Council.

On being put to the meeting, the voting on the Motion was four (4) votes for and five (5) votes against. Councillor Salvestro-Martin abstained from the voting and accordingly his vote was recorded Against the Motion. The Motion was **LOST**.

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

## **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Stott, Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin and Simon

<u>Note</u>: Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM left the meeting at 12.53am and did not return.

## ADJOURNMENT

In accordance with Clause 4.2.4 of the Code of Meeting Practice, a quorum was not present, the time being 12.53am on Thursday, 27 April 2017.

The following Councillors were present: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Pendleton, Perram and Simon.

The following Councillors were not present: Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM.

An apology had been received from Councillor Li.

- <u>Note</u>: Due to Council not completing the Agenda of 26 April 2017, this meeting stands adjourned. No time and date was formally set for the reconvened meeting and this will be confirmed by Friday, 5 May 2017.
- <u>Note</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering adjourned this meeting to Tuesday, 9 May 2017, to commence at the conclusion of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting in the Council Chambers, Level 1A, 1 Pope Street, Ryde.

#### MEETING RECONVENED

The Meeting reconvened in Confidential Closed Session at 6.26pm on Tuesday, 9 May 2017 in the Council Chambers, Level 1A, 1 Pope Street, Ryde.

The following Councillors were present: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Li, Maggio, Pendleton, Perram, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM.

An apology had been received from Councillor Simon.

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Perram left the meeting at 8.50pm and did not return. He was not present for consideration or voting on the Notice of Rescission for Item 6, Item 5(10) and Item 9.

#### ATTACHMENT 1

**Staff Present:** Acting General Manager, Acting Director – Customer and Community Services, Acting Director – Corporate and Organisational Support Services, Acting Director – City Planning and Development, Director – City Works and Infrastructure, General Counsel, Acting Manager – City Planning, Acting Manager – Strategic Human Resources, Development Contributions Coordinator, Senior Coordinator – Governance and Governance, Risk and Audit Coordinator.

## ONE MINUTE SILENCE

Councillor Maggio requested that Council observe a one minute silence to acknowledge the passing of Mr Keith Aggett, President of the Ryde Eastwood Leagues Club.

Note: A one minute silence was then observed by the meeting.

## LEAVE OF ABSENCE

Councillor Perram requested a Leave of Absence for the period 15 May 2017 to 25 May 2017 inclusive.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Perram and Maggio)

That Councillor Perram's Leave of Absence for the period from 15 May 2017 to 25 May 2017 inclusive be approved.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

The Mayor, Councillor Pickering requested the concurrence of Council to alter the Order of Business in Confidential Closed Session to enable Council to consider the remaining Agenda Items in the following order, the time being 6.37pm:-

- ITEM 7 Offer to Enter into a Voluntary Planning Agreement From Greenland to Embellish Community Facility in Exchange for Vehicular Access Stratum Under Jarvis Circuit linking LOTS 104 and 105 in DP 1224238 Lachlans Line, Macquarie Park
- ITEM 6 Draft Voluntary Planning Agreement with Holdmark 66-82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park
- ITEM 2(3) 66-82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park Amendment to the Gateway Determination



**ATTACHMENT 1** 

- ITEM 5(1) Advice on Court Actions
- ITEM 9 Staff Matters Senior Staff Contracts

Note: The concurrence of Council was granted.

## **COUNCIL REPORTS - CONFIDENTIAL**

- 7 OFFER TO ENTER INTO A VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT FROM GREENLAND TO EMBELLISH COMMUNITY FACILITY IN EXCHANGE FOR VEHICULAR ACCESS STRATUM UNDER JARVIS CIRCUIT LINKING LOTS 104 AND 105 IN DP 1224238 LACHLANS LINE, MACQUARIE PARK
  - <u>Note</u>: A Confidential Memorandum from the Acting Director City Planning and Development dated 8 May 2017 was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE – CONFIDENTIAL.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

- (a) That Council accept, the letter of offer as detailed in ATTACHMENT 1 dated 24 February 2017, from Urbis on behalf of Greenland (Sydney) Lachlan's Line Macquarie Park Development Pty Ltd (Greenland), to enter into a Voluntary Planning Agreement in relation to two (2) Development Applications for a multi-storey mixed use residential/commercial buildings at 25-27 Epping Road on land legally described as LOTS 104 and 105 in DP1224238, subject to the following terms:
  - i. Greenland agreeing to meet all of Council's reasonable costs in regards to the preparation of the Voluntary Planning Agreement;
  - ii. Greenland agreeing to meet all of Council's costs in regards to the transfer of the land for the vehicular access stratum;
  - iii. Greenland agreeing to the provision of sufficient security for the public benefit; and
  - iv. Greenland agreeing to the provision of sufficient security for works in the public domain (Jarvis Circuit) for the construction of the vehicular access tunnels.
- (b) Should Greenland accept the above terms in part (a) of the recommendation, Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and to subsequently exhibit a draft of the Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.



#### ATTACHMENT 1

- (c) The Voluntary Planning Agreement delegated to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of will require Greenland to:
  - i. Provide public benefit by Works-in-Kind to the value of \$900,000 for construction and fitout of the proposed Community Facility on LOT 104 in DP 1224238. For clarity, the works-in-kind are in addition to the requirements to provide the Community Facility referred to in the Planning Agreement between Council and Landcom (t/a Urban Growth NSW) executed on 20 October 2016.
  - ii. meet all of Council's reasonable costs in regards to the preparation of the Voluntary Planning Agreement;
  - iii. meet all of Council's reasonable costs in regards to the transfer of the land for the vehicular access stratum;
  - iv. provide sufficient security for the public benefit; and
  - v. provide sufficient security for works in public domain (Jarvis Circuit) for the construction of the vehicular access tunnels.
- (d) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to:
  - i. Authorise any minor changes to the draft Voluntary Planning Agreement, following its public exhibition, provided that those changes do not diminish the value or nature of the public benefits to be delivered as identified in (c) above;
  - ii. Subsequently enter into the Voluntary Planning Agreement on behalf of Council.
- (e) That Urbis on behalf of Greenland, be informed of Council's decision.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

#### 6 DRAFT VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT WITH HOLDMARK - 66-82 TALAVERA ROAD, MACQUARIE PARK

- <u>Note</u>: A Confidential Memorandum from the Acting Director City Planning and Development dated 8 May 2017 was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE – CONFIDENTIAL.
- <u>Note</u>: A Comparison Table prepared by Council staff was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE CONFIDENTIAL.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillor Salvestro-Martin and Maggio)

That the Applicant be invited to join the Meeting to answer questions and clarify any issues in respect of this matter, time being 7.24pm.

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

## Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Li, Maggio, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Perram

<u>Note</u>: Mr Sarkis Nassif, Mr Gavin Carrier and Ms Sue Tan from Holdmark and Mr Michael Harrison from Architectus Consultants joined the Confidential Closed Session at 7.26pm.

## **OPEN SESSION**

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Maggio)

That Council resolve itself into open Council.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Li, Pendleton and Perram

Note: Open Council resumed at 8.12pm.

#### 6 DRAFT VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT WITH HOLDMARK - 66-82 TALAVERA ROAD, MACQUARIE PARK

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Maggio)

- (a) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and subsequently exhibit a draft Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979; and execute the Voluntary Planning Agreement should there be no submissions during the exhibition period.
- (b) That the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement must include the following additional terms to those accepted by Council in its resolution of 26 July 2016;



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

- i. Public benefits to the value of no less than \$145 million, indexed annually (Sydney CPI), justified by valuations undertaken by Quantity Surveyors at Holdmark's cost and this figure is to exclude Section 94 which is to be paid in full with future Development Applications.
- ii. Sufficient securities as prescribed by Section 93F(3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.
- (c) That any further negotiations with Holdmark on this matter, be independently facilitated by a third party commercial mediator with costs to be met equally by Holdmark and Council.

## **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Li, Pendleton and Perram

<u>Note</u>: A Rescission Motion in relation to this matter was lodged by Councillors Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Maggio at 8.45pm on Tuesday, 9 May 2017 during the Reconvened Council Meeting of 26 April 2017.

## 2 REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE MEETING 3/17 held on 11 April 2017

#### 3 66 - 82 TALAVERA ROAD MACQUARIE PARK - AMENDMENT TO THE GATEWAY DETERMINATION

**MOTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

- (a) That Council request that the Department of Planning and Environment amend the Gateway Determination issued in respect of 66 – 82 Talavera Road Macquarie Park to reflect the Council resolutions of 26 July 2016. Specifically the Gateway Determination conditions are to the be amended as follows:
  - GFA exclusion of 11,400sqm for affordable housing and a recreation centre.

Amended to;

• GFA exclusion of 8,796sqm for affordable housing and recreation facility.

<u>and;</u>

• Additional exclusion from GFA for 1,030 commercial car park spaces.



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

- (b) That Council;
  - i) Does not support the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to exclude from GFA of any wind affected balcony from the calculation of FSR; and
  - ii) Supports the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to specify a minimum of 20,000sqm of non-residential floor space be delivered on the site.
  - iii) Supports the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to increase the maximum height in the centre of the site from 120m to 154m
- (c) That Council acknowledge the Applicant's desire to create a superior design outcome for the use of the wind affected balconies within the development and the consideration on the exclusion of the enclosed wind affected balconies from the GFA, be deferred for consideration at the Development Application stage.
- (d) That Council prepare a Development Control Plan for the property 66

   82 Talavera Road and that a separate report be presented to Council on this matter.
- (e) That Council forward a request to the Department of Planning and Environment to amend the Gateway Determination in accordance with the above resolutions.

## Note: PRIOR TO VOTING ON THIS MATTER, A FURTHER MOTION WAS CONSIDERED BY COUNCIL.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Stott)

That Council allow the Applicant to address the Council in respect of the previous resolution and the current Motion on this matter.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Mr Sarkis Nassif, Mr Gavin Carrier and Ms Sue Tan from Holdmark and Mr Michael Harrison from Architectus Consultants then addressed Council in respect of the previous resolution regarding Item 6 – Draft Voluntary Planning Agreement with Holdmark for 66-82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park and also on the current Motion before Council in relation to Item 3(2) from the Planning and Environment Committee Meeting 3/17 held on 11 April 2017 – 66-82 Talavera Road, Macquarie Park – Amendment to the Gateway Determination.



**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

- (a) That Council request that the Department of Planning and Environment amend the Gateway Determination issued in respect of 66 – 82 Talavera Road Macquarie Park to reflect the Council resolutions of 26 July 2016. Specifically the Gateway Determination conditions are to the be amended as follows:
  - GFA exclusion of 11,400sqm for affordable housing and a recreation centre.

#### Amended to;

• GFA exclusion of 8,796sqm for affordable housing and recreation facility.

<u>and;</u>

- Additional exclusion from GFA for 1,030 commercial car park spaces.
- (b) That Council;
  - i) Does not support the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to exclude from GFA of any wind affected balcony from the calculation of FSR; and
  - ii) Supports the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to specify a minimum of 20,000sqm of non-residential floor space be delivered on the site.
  - iii) Supports the request to further amend the Planning Proposal and the Gateway Determination to increase the maximum height in the centre of the site from 120m to 154m.
- (c) That Council acknowledge the Applicant's desire to create a superior design outcome for the use of the wind affected balconies within the development and the consideration on the exclusion of the enclosed wind affected balconies from the GFA, be deferred for consideration at the Development Application stage.
- (d) That Council prepare a Development Control Plan for the property 66

   82 Talavera Road and that a separate report be presented to Council on this matter.
- (e) That Council forward a request to the Department of Planning and Environment to amend the Gateway Determination in accordance with the above resolutions.

## **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Li, Pendleton and Perram



**ATTACHMENT 1** 

## **NOTICES OF RESCISSION**

1 NOTICE OF RESCISSION: ITEM 6 – DRAFT VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT WITH HOLDMARK - 66-82 TALAVERA ROAD, MACQUARIE PARK

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Perram left the meeting at 8.50pm and did not return. He was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Stott)

That Council rescind the previous resolution in relation to Item 6 – DRAFT VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT WITH HOLDMARK – 66-82 TALAVERA ROAD, MACQUARIE PARK, passed on 9 May 2017 during the Reconvened Council Meeting of 26 April 2017, namely:

- (a) That Council delegate authority to the Acting General Manager to negotiate the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement and subsequently exhibit a draft Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979; and execute the Voluntary Planning Agreement should there be no submissions during the exhibition period.
- (b) That the specific terms of the Voluntary Planning Agreement must include the following additional terms to those accepted by Council in its resolution of 26 July 2016;
  - i. Public benefits to the value of no less than \$145 million, indexed annually (Sydney CPI), justified by valuations undertaken by Quantity Surveyors at Holdmark's cost and this figure is to exclude Section 94 which is to be paid in full with future Development Applications.
  - *ii.* Sufficient securities as prescribed by Section 93F(3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.
- (c) That any further negotiations with Holdmark on this matter, be independently facilitated by a third party commercial mediator with costs to be met equally by Holdmark and Council.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Rescission Motion was seven (7) votes For and one (1) vote Against. The Rescission Motion was **CARRIED**.

## Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Li, Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Pendleton

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

Note: The Matter is therefore AT LARGE.

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Perram was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Salvestro-Martin and Maggio)

That Council ratify the resolution of 26 July 2016, specifically;

(a) That Council accept the irrevocable letters of offer from Holdmark dated 21 and 26 July 2016 to enter into a Voluntary Planning Agreement in accordance with Option 3 from the Council Report from 26 July 2016 on the same matter (set out below);

Item	Option 3 (3.7:1 FSR)
Affordable Housing	5,296sqm, approx. 70 units, being 4% of residential yield
	\$63 million market value
Land Dedication	\$15 million
10,000sqm for Park and Indoor Recreation Centre	(no evidence of valuation provided)
6,000sqm of Open Space Embellishment	\$5 million
Indoor Recreation Centre 3,500sqm with 3 commercial tenancies and 20 car parking spaces	\$45 million plus 2.5 hours of free parking for up to 180 spaces
Pedestrian Over Bridge – Talavera Road	\$10 million
Contribution to Road Works	\$5 million
Pedestrian Matters	4.5m wide footpath along Talavera Road for frontage of site
Section 94 Contributions	\$15 million capped
TOTAL ESTIMATES (NOTE: Estimates do not include S94 Contributions)	\$143 million

(b) That Council forward, within 7 days, the Planning Proposal to the Department of Planning and Environment for Gateway Determination.

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

## **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Maggio, Salvestro-Martin, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillors Li and Pendleton

#### **CLOSED SESSION**

Note: Councillor Perram was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

That the Council resolve into Closed Session.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

<u>Note</u>: The Council closed the meeting at 9.06pm. The public and media left the chamber.

## **COUNCIL REPORTS - CONFIDENTIAL**

#### 5 REPORT OF THE FINANCE AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE MEETING 3/17 held on 18 April 2017

## 10 ADVICE ON COURT ACTIONS

Note: Councillor Perram was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Laxale)

That the report of the General Counsel be received and that General Counsel is instructed to act as per his advice provided in Confidential Session for the following matter:-

 Principal Healthcare Finance Pty Ltd LEC Proceedings – additions to existing Nursing Home, Mons Avenue and Sherbrook Road, West Ryde.

## **Record for the Voting:**

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Li, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin and Stott

Against the Motion: Councillors Maggio and Yedelian OAM



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Perram was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Salvestro-Martin)

That the report of the General Counsel be received and that General Counsel is instructed to act as per his advice provided in Confidential Session for the following matter:-

• 1139 Victoria Road, West Ryde LEC Proceedings

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Councillors Laxale, Li, Pendleton, Salvestro-Martin and Stott

Against the Motion: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Maggio and Yedelian OAM

#### 7 OFFER TO ENTER INTO A VOLUNTARY PLANNING AGREEMENT FROM GREENLAND TO EMBELLISH COMMUNITY FACILITY IN EXCHANGE FOR VEHICULAR ACCESS STRATUM UNDER JARVIS CIRCUIT LINKING LOTS 104 AND 105 IN DP 1224238 LACHLANS LINE, MACQUARIE PARK

Note: This matter was dealt with earlier in the meeting as detailed in these minutes.

<u>Note</u>: All Staff left the meeting at 9.14pm, with the exception of the Acting General Manager, the Acting Manager Strategic Human Resources and Administration staff.

#### 9 STAFF MATTERS - SENIOR STAFF CONTRACTS

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Perram was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

That Council endorse the Acting General Manager to take the appropriate action in renewing the contracts of the senior staff as detailed in this report.

#### Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

## ATTACHMENT 1

## **OPEN SESSION**

Note: Councillor Perram was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Maggio)

That Council resolve itself into open Council.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Open Council resumed at 9.22pm.

Note: Councillor Perram was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Maggio and Stott)

That the recommendations of Items considered in Closed Session be received and adopted as resolutions of Council without any alteration or amendment thereto.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

## NATIONAL ANTHEM

The National Anthem was sung at the conclusion of the meeting.

The meeting closed at 9.25pm on Tuesday, 9 May 2017.

## CONFIRMED THIS 23RD DAY OF MAY 2017

Chairperson



#### 2 REPORT OF THE PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE MEETING 4/17 held on 9 May 2017

**Report prepared by:** Senior Coordinator - Governance **File No.:** CLM/17/1/3/2 - BP17/469

#### REPORT SUMMARY

Attached are the Minutes of the Planning and Environment Committee Meeting 4/17 held on 9 May 2017. The Minutes will be listed for confirmation at the next Planning and Environment Committee Meeting.

Items 1, 3 and 4 were dealt with by the Committee within its delegated powers.

The following Committee recommendation for Item 2 is submitted to Council for determination in accordance with the delegations set out in Council's Code of Meeting Practice relating to Charters, functions and powers of Committees:

- 2 118 BALACLAVA ROAD, MARSFIELD. LOT 8 DP 16216. Local Development Application for construction of two-storey boarding house containing 10 boarding rooms. LDA2016/0287.
- <u>Note</u>: Mark Shanahan (representing Houseroom Pty Ltd property owner) addressed the meeting in relation to this Item.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Pendleton)

- (a) That Local Development Application No. LDA2016/0287 be approved via deferred commencement, subject to the **ATTACHED** conditions (Attachment 1).
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Councillors Laxale and Pendleton

Against the Motion: Councillors Stott and Yedelian OAM

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **23 MAY 2017** as dissenting votes were recorded.

#### ATTACHMENTS

1 MINUTES - Planning and Environment Committee Meeting - 9 May 2017



Council Reports Page 52

**ITEM 2 (continued)** 

ATTACHMENT 1

## Planning and Environment Committee MINUTES OF MEETING NO. 4/17

# Meeting Date:Tuesday 9 May 2017Location:Council Chambers, Level 1A, 1 Pope Street, RydeTime:5.00pm

**Councillors Present:** Councillors Yedelian OAM (Chairperson), Laxale, Pendleton and Stott.

Apologies: Councillor Simon.

Absent: Councillors Maggio and Salvestro-Martin.

**Staff Present:** Acting General Manager, Acting Director – City Planning and Development, Acting Director – Corporate and Organisational Support Services, Acting Manager – Assessment, Acting Manager – City Planning, Senior Coordinator – Development Assessment, Senior Town Planner, Senior Coordinator – Development Engineering Services, Town Planning Consultant (Planning Ingenuity), Senior Coordinator – Governance and Governance, Risk and Audit Coordinator.

## DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

There were no disclosures of interest.

#### 1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Meeting held on 11 April 2017

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Stott and Pendleton)

That the Minutes of the Planning and Environment Committee 3/17, held on 11 April 2017, be confirmed.

#### Record for the Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This is now a resolution of Council in accordance with the Committee's delegated powers.

#### 2 118 BALACLAVA ROAD, MARSFIELD. LOT 8 DP 16216. Local Development Application for construction of two-storey boarding house containing 10 boarding rooms. LDA2016/0287

Note: This matter was dealt with later in the meeting as detailed in these Minutes.



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

- 3 1 STANSELL STREET, GLADESVILLE. LOT 1 in DP 6026. Local Development Application of demolition and construction of a 6 storey Residential Flat Building containing 23 apartments and three levels of basement car parking. LDA2016/0151
- <u>Note</u>: Michael Brewer (representing Concorde Enterprises Pty Ltd applicant) addressed the meeting in relation to this Item.
- <u>Note</u>: A Memorandum from the Acting Director City Planning and Development dated 9 May 2017 was tabled in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Stott)

- (a) That LDA2016/0151 at 1 Stansell Street, Gladesville be approved as a deferred commencement consent and subject to the conditions in the **ATTACHED** conditions (Attachment 1).
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

#### Record for the Voting:

#### For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This is now a resolution of Council in accordance with the Committee's delegated powers.

#### 2 118 BALACLAVA ROAD, MARSFIELD. LOT 8 DP 16216. Local Development Application for construction of two-storey boarding house containing 10 boarding rooms. LDA2016/0287.

<u>Note</u>: Mark Shanahan (representing Houseroom Pty Ltd – property owner) addressed the meeting in relation to this Item.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Pendleton)

- (a) That Local Development Application No. LDA2016/0287 be approved via deferred commencement, subject to the **ATTACHED** conditions (Attachment 1).
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Councillors Laxale and Pendleton

Against the Motion: Councillors Stott and Yedelian OAM

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **23 MAY 2017** as dissenting votes were recorded.



#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

3 1 STANSELL STREET, GLADESVILLE. LOT 1 in DP 6026. Local Development Application of demolition and construction of a 6 storey Residential Flat Building containing 23 apartments and three levels of basement car parking. LDA2016/0151

Note: This matter was dealt with earlier in the meeting as detailed in these Minutes.

## 4 PLANNING PROPOSAL UPDATE - 176 BLAXLAND ROAD, RYDE

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Stott)

That Council prepare amendments to Ryde Development Control Plan 2014 for the site and exhibit these amendments concurrently with the exhibition of the Planning Proposal for 176 Blaxland Road, Ryde.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This is now a resolution of Council in accordance with the Committee's delegated powers.

The meeting closed at 5.27pm.

CONFIRMED THIS 13TH DAY OF JUNE 2017.

Chairperson



#### 3 REPORT OF THE RYDE CIVIC HUB COMMITTEE MEETING 4/17 held on 9 May 2017

Report prepared by: Senior Coordinator - Governance File No.: CLM/17/1/4/2 - BP17/470

#### REPORT SUMMARY

Attached are the Minutes of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting 4/17 held on 9 May 2017. The Minutes will be listed for confirmation at the next Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting.

The following Committee recommendations for all Items 1 and 2 are submitted to Council for determination in accordance with the delegations set out in the Code of Meeting Practice relating to Charters, functions and powers of Committees:

#### 1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting held on 11 April 2017

Note: Councillor Pendleton disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reason that her continued and consistent opposition to the sale/redevelopment of the Civic Centre public land with the inclusion of highrise residential development, the loss of the bus interchange and internal auditorium and other community amenity is consistent with her core commitment made to the electorate at the 2012 elections.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillor Yedelian OAM and The Mayor, Councillor Pickering)

That the Minutes of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee 3/17, held on 11 April 2017, be confirmed.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **23 MAY 2017** in accordance with the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Terms of Reference in Council's Code of Meeting Practice.

#### 2 RYDE CIVIC HUB INTERNATIONAL DESIGN COMPETITION STATUS REPORT 18 - MAY 2017

Note: Councillor Pendleton disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reason that her continued and consistent opposition to the sale/redevelopment of the Civic Centre public land with the inclusion of highrise residential development, the loss of the bus interchange and internal auditorium and other community amenity is consistent with her core commitment made to the electorate at the 2012 elections.



**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Yedelian OAM)

That the Committee receives and notes the content of this report.

#### Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Perram, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Pendleton

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **23 MAY 2017** in accordance with the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Terms of Reference in Council's Code of Meeting Practice.

#### ATTACHMENTS

1 MINUTES - Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting - 9 May 2017



ATTACHMENT 1

## Ryde Civic Hub Committee **MINUTES OF MEETING NO. 4/17**

# Meeting Date:Tuesday 9 May 2017Location:Council Chambers, Level 1A, 1 Pope Street, RydeTime:6.00pm

**Councillors Present:** The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Stott (Chairperson), Laxale, Pendleton, Perram and Yedelian OAM.

Apologies: Councillor Simon.

Absent: Councillors Maggio and Salvestro-Martin.

**Staff Present:** Acting General Manager, Acting Director – Customer and Community Services, Acting Director – Corporate and Organisational Support Services, Acting Director – City Planning and Development, Director – City Works and Infrastructure, General Counsel, Executive Officer – Ryde Civic Hub, Acting Manager – City Planning, Development Contributions Coordinator, Senior Coordinator – Governance, Governance and Risk and Audit Coordinator.

#### **DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST**

Councillor Pendleton disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in all Items (1 and 2) on this Committee - Meeting Number 4/17, for the reason that her continued and consistent opposition to the sale/redevelopment of the Civic Centre public land with the inclusion of high-rise residential development, the loss of the bus interchange and internal auditorium and other community amenity is consistent with her core commitment made to the electorate at the 2012 elections.

#### 1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Ryde Civic Hub Committee Meeting held on 11 April 2017

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Pendleton disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reason that her continued and consistent opposition to the sale/redevelopment of the Civic Centre public land with the inclusion of highrise residential development, the loss of the bus interchange and internal auditorium and other community amenity is consistent with her core commitment made to the electorate at the 2012 elections.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by Councillor Yedelian OAM and The Mayor, Councillor Pickering)

That the Minutes of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee 3/17, held on 11 April 2017, be confirmed.

#### **ATTACHMENT 1**

#### **Record for the Voting:**

#### For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **23 MAY 2017** in accordance with the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Terms of Reference in Council's Code of Meeting Practice.

#### 2 RYDE CIVIC HUB INTERNATIONAL DESIGN COMPETITION STATUS REPORT 18 - MAY 2017

<u>Note</u>: Councillor Pendleton disclosed a Less than Significant Non-Pecuniary Interest in this Item for the reason that her continued and consistent opposition to the sale/redevelopment of the Civic Centre public land with the inclusion of highrise residential development, the loss of the bus interchange and internal auditorium and other community amenity is consistent with her core commitment made to the electorate at the 2012 elections.

**RECOMMENDATION:** (Moved by The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Yedelian OAM)

That the Committee receives and notes the content of this report.

#### Record for the Voting:

<u>For the Motion</u>: The Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillors Laxale, Perram, Stott and Yedelian OAM

Against the Motion: Councillor Pendleton

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **23 MAY 2017** in accordance with the Ryde Civic Hub Committee Terms of Reference in Council's Code of Meeting Practice.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF COUNCIL STAFF MEMBER, MALCOLM HARRILD

**RESOLUTION:** (Moved by the Mayor, Councillor Pickering and Councillor Stott)

That members of the Ryde Civic Hub Committee thank Council's Executive Officer – Ryde Civic Hub, Mr Malcolm Harrild for all of his work and efforts on the Ryde Civic Hub Project.

#### **Record for the Voting:**

For the Motion: Unanimous

The meeting closed at 6.10pm.

#### CONFIRMED THIS 13TH DAY OF JUNE 2017.

Chairperson



#### 4 REPORT OF THE WORKS AND COMMUNITY COMMITTEE MEETING 3/17 held on 16 May 2017

**Report prepared by:** Senior Coordinator - Governance **File No.:** CLM/17/1/2/2 - BP17/471

#### **REPORT SUMMARY**

The Minutes of the Works and Community Committee Meeting 3/17 held on 16 May 2017 are to be circulated on Thursday, 18 May 2017 after the meeting has been conducted. The Minutes will be listed for confirmation at the next Works and Community Committee Meeting.

A report detailing Items which were dealt with by the Committee within its delegated powers, together with any Committee recommendations will be circulated at the same time as the Minutes on Thursday, 18 May 2017.



#### 5 REPORT OF THE FINANCE AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE MEETING 4/17 held on 16 May 2017

Report prepared by: Senior Coordinator - Governance File No.: CLM/17/1/5/2 - BP17/472

## **REPORT SUMMARY**

The Minutes of the Finance and Governance Committee Meeting 4/17 held on 16 May 2017 are to be circulated on Thursday, 18 May 2017 after the meeting has been conducted. The Minutes will be listed for confirmation at the next Finance and Governance Committee Meeting.

In accordance with the delegations set out in the Code of Meeting Practice relating to Charters, functions and powers of Committees, a report detailing the Committee recommendations will be circulated at the same time as the Minutes on Thursday, 18 May 2017.



#### 6 RYDE YOUTH THEATRE: UPDATE ON INVESTIGATIONS INTO ALTERNATE FUNDING SOURCES

**Report prepared by:** Community Project Officer - Young People **File No.:** GRP/09/7/7 - BP17/417

#### **REPORT SUMMARY**

In October 2016, Council officers prepared and presented a report to Council that was in support of the continued funding for the Ryde Youth Theatre **(ATTACHMENT 1)**. The report highlighted the positive impact that the Ryde Youth Theatre (RYT) had on the lives of young people residing in the City of Ryde and summarised their achievements in the form of testimonies from parents in support of the RYT program. The report additionally sought to extend the funding of \$75,000 per annum for an additional two years being; 2016/17 and 2017/18. This was to assist in running the RYT program whilst Council Officers attempted to identify future funding opportunities for the program.

Council officers outlined a range of possible administrative and funding options that could possibly sustain the program into future should Council funding not be made available beyond 2015/16. These options included:

- Establishing Ryde Youth Theatre as an independent legal entity whilst finding and securing an auspice for the Ryde Youth Theatre.
- The possibility of a merger with an existing theatre company in Hunters Hill or Lane Cove.
- Seeking funding from a State or Federal body.
- Seeking a philanthropic or corporate donor and increasing enrolment fees and revenue from ticket sales.

An investigation of the above options did not reveal any satisfactory alternatives that would allow the RYT to continue operating, this was due to:

- The lack of government funding for start-ups like RYT and the ongoing under funding of the arts sector.
- The requirement of a 10% fee by the auspicing organisation to cover their administrative fee and unavailability of additional funds required for the transition phase.
- The lack of synergies, within the various community theatre programs run by Hunters Hill and Lane Cove Councils, who mainly rely on income from ticket sales.



- The limited ability of philanthropic and/or private organisations to gain any tax incentives from funding small projects and fully support the RYT, although the potential for project based funding exists.
- The total income generated by the RYT ticket sales and registration fee is not enough to sustain its operations.

At its meeting held on 25 October 2016, Council unanimously resolved:

- (a) That Council allocates the amount of \$75,000 for one year 2016/17 for the purpose of funding the Ryde Youth Theatre project to be funded from General Revenue, noting there will be a continuing search for alternate ongoing funding arrangements.
- (b) That a further report be provided to Council in March 2017 with the results of further investigations into possible alternate funding sources for the Ryde Youth Theatre project.
- (c) That Council considers this allocation in future as a community or cultural grant.

The outcomes of further investigations that were conducted by Council officers during the period October 2016 through to February 2017 are presented in this report. A key focus of the investigation was the exploration of alternative funding sources and other possible avenues for sustaining the activities of the RYT.

Council officers explored possible avenues for corporate support from businesses based at Macquarie Park and investigated the option of the RYT being established as a Trust, this was based on similar models of support available within the local government sector. As recommended in Council's resolution, Council officers investigated the possibility of supporting the RYT program within the City of Ryde's current Community and Cultural Grants program.

The details of these investigations are outline further in the body of this report. In light of these investigations, the report recommends that Council continues to fund the RYT program to the tune of \$75,000 per annum as investigations to date indicate:

- 1) There is a continued lack of viable funding sources to support the ongoing continuation of the program.
- 2) There is a limited capacity for corporate and philanthropic funding to support the program.
- 3) There exists a high level of interest and demand for the program within the local community.



Whilst Council continues to fund the RYT program Council Officers will continue to actively seek alternate sources of funding to support the program, though it is noted that as has already been indicated within this report, that this may prove to be difficult.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

- (a) That Council endorses Option 3 to allocate the amount of \$75,000 per annum, for 4 years; being 2017/18 to 2020/21 for the purpose of funding the Ryde Youth Theatre program and that this be funded from the General Revenue budget to allow for stability and additional resources to sustain the activities of the program whilst Council Officers continue to explore long term options for the program.
- (b) That a further report with an update on the Ryde Youth Theatre be provided to Council in October 2019.
- (c) That the Ryde Youth Theatre provides a report on their activities and financials to be included in Council's Annual Financial Report.

## ATTACHMENTS

- 1 Continued Funding for Ryde Youth Theatre
- 2 RYT Sponsorship packages Draft 1

**Report Prepared By:** 

## Michael Paine

**Community Project Officer - Young People** 

Report Approved By:

Gunjan Tripathi Senior Coordinator Social Development and Capacity Building

Paul Chidzero Manager - Community Services

Angela Jones-Blayney Acting Director - Customer and Community Services



#### Background

Council Officers prepared and presented a report for Council's consideration in October 2016 supporting the continued funding for Ryde Youth Theatre (RYT). The report highlighted the positive impact that the RYT program has had on the lives of young people living within the LGA and the need to secure alternative sources of funding to ensure the sustainability of the program.

An investigation of funding options did not reveal any satisfactory alternatives that would allow RYT to deliver the beneficial outcomes to young people in Ryde, noting:

- The lack of government funding for start –ups like the RYT and the ongoing defunding of arts sector.
- The requirement of a 10% fee by the auspicing organisation to cover their administrative fee and unavailability of additional funds required for the transition phase.
- The lack of synergies with the community theatre programs ran by Hunters Hill and Lane Cove Councils that mainly rely on ticket sales income.
- The limited ability of philanthropic and/or private organisations to gain any tax incentives by funding small project and fully support the RYT program, although the potential for project based funding still remains a possibility.
- The total income generated by the RYT ticket sales and fee is not enough to sustain its operations.

In October 2016, Council resolved to extend the RYT funding to 2016/17 financial year. Council officers were tasked to further investigate alternate funding sources for the program and present their findings to Council in March 2017. It is noted that during this period, the RYT was successful in securing the use of Westward Cottage through an Expression of Interest process. The costs associated to the use of Westward Cottage are being funded through the allocated Net \$75,000 budget allocation.

#### Discussion

## The Strategic Context for Arts and Cultural Activities for Young People within the City of Ryde

The need for provision of cultural and art avenues for young people has been well documented in several strategic planning documents at the local and regional levels. These documents outline the value arts and cultural activities offer to the young people in order to build their self-esteem, create mental and emotional well-being and help facilitate positive engagement with the community through self-expression.



A Plan for "Growing Sydney" outlines strategies to develop Greater Sydney as an international arts and cultural destination and to integrate arts and cultural policies and investment with broader development and urban renewal efforts across the city.

Specifically, the Northern District Plan identifies that the "local arts and cultural facilities help the North District's residents to connect, celebrate and identify with one another". This plan outlines *Liveability Priority 8: Support the creative arts and culture* and emphasises that relevant planning authorities should:

• Integrate arts and cultural outcomes into urban development through planning proposals for urban renewal areas and priority precincts that nurture a culture of art in everyday local spaces and enhance access to the arts in all communities.

At its meeting on 25 June 2013, Council endorsed the Ryde 2025 Community Strategic Plan. The plan highlights addressing the needs of a changing population and to ensure that "Our community is able to learn and grow through a wealth of art, culture and lifelong learning opportunities." The City of Ryde has continued its commitment to provide avenues for artistic expressions across all age groups and cultural backgrounds. The RYT program facilitates the progression of this objective for young people, who benefit from the learning and development opportunities the program offers in creating future pathways for employment, community and cultural connections.

In 2007, The City of Ryde resolved to adopt a draft Arts Framework. One of the main elements of the Framework included greater access to the arts, creating additional opportunities to benefit from the personal growth, social connections and increased vitality and wellbeing that result from participation in the arts, giving young people stepping stones for artistic development, and providing creative people with more opportunities to develop skills and showcase talents.

Regionally, creative arts are recognised as a key instrument in developing local identity. Lane Cove Council's "*Create Lane Cove*" strategic plan identifies arts as a community's creative identity and an opportunity for self-expression. The plan states that "*Council has an opportunity to nurture and support this within what is already an artistic, highly literate and creative community particularly in the area of performing arts, music and art. It is clear the balance needs to exist between individual and community cultural identity.*" The RYT program enables young people to become a part of our cultural identity and provides a creative outlet to showcase their talent in a multifaceted way. The program offers a unique opportunity to young people in the absence of any other similar program being offered within the region.

#### The Ryde Youth Theatre Current Funding Status

The Ryde Youth Theatre program has been funded by the City of Ryde since 2009. The following table identifies the annual budget allocations since 2009 through to 2016.

Year	Funding	Year	Funding
2009/10	\$1,600	2013/14	\$57,147
2010/11	\$16,705	2014/15	\$68,221
2011/12	\$42,000	2015/16	\$70,000
2012/13	\$51,212	2016/17	\$75,000
			Total \$381,885

A breakdown of the RYT program 2015/16 budget is provided in the table below.

Expenditure	Description	2015/16
Employment costs	Part time artistic director	\$50,000
Program and workshop costs	Productions (materials, promotion, contractors, cleaning etc.)	\$25,000
Venue hire (in-kind)		\$15,000
Total Expenses		\$90,000
Income	Earned income (fees and ticket sales)	- \$15,000
Net Budget		\$75,000
Allocation		

Income earned through enrolment fees and ticket sales contributes to the RYT program budget expenditure.

A Breakdown of income 2016/17 is provided in the table below:

INCOME TYPE	Cost per person	Number Sold	TOTAL
TICKET SALES			
The Doorbell –	\$5	144	\$720
Underground Writers			
Remember Me –	\$20 and \$10	91	\$1,320
Major Production			
Don't Tell The	\$5	53	\$265
Others – Monday			
ensemble production			
TERM FEES	\$65	60	\$3,900
(terms 3 and 4 only)			
TOTAL			\$6,205

Based on the current Fees and Charges Schedule, Council additionally provides inkind support to the RYT in venue hire to the value of approximately \$15,000 annually.



The revenue generated from the fees and charges and the ticket sales for the program currently only generates a minimum level of income of \$15,000 per annum and this income is largely used to contribute to the production cost of the theatre program.

A major proportion of funds allocated towards the RYT program is spent on the employment costs for a part- time Artistic Director. The other elements of program funding are managed as efficiently as possible, this is in order as to provide as many opportunities as possible to the young people to assist in building their skills through a number of productions during the course of the year.

## Participant Fees and Charges Schedule

Due to Council subsidies, the fees and charges associated with the RYT program are kept at an affordable level. These fees and charges are much lower in comparison to other similar theatre groups across the Sydney metropolitan area. Council subsidies help keep this unique program accessible and affordable to a wide range of young people who would otherwise find it difficult to access a program of this quality.

Program	Duration	Cost per participant
Theatre skills development workshops	10 weeks	\$65
Writing workshops	10 weeks	\$30
School holiday workshop	School holidays	\$30
Short playwriting course	8 weeks	\$90
Tickets to minor production		\$5
Tickets to major production		\$20 (concession - \$10)

In 2016/17 a review of the fees and charges resulted in the following schedule:

#### The Measures Taken to Maintain High Quality Production at Low Cost

The RYT program is growing in its popularity. Several measures have been taken to minimise the costs associated with the production of this program whilst meeting the community expectations for a high quality production. These measures include:

#### 1. Parent and Alumni Engagement in Volunteering

Parents and alumni of the RYT program play an important role in the various aspects of the production. In 2016 it is estimated that over 300 hours of volunteer time was donated towards the RYT program productions.



There are a number of roles volunteers play in providing their assistance to the RYT program. These include:

- Alumni members assisting with, new productions, back stage, lighting, costume and prop making.
- Parents assisting with venue set up (bump in and bump out), prop building, front of house and theatre set building.
- Theatre professionals helping with lighting workshops, dramaturgy and choreography.
- RYT Artistic Director additionally volunteers her personal time to the project, this is over and above her paid duties.

#### 2. Development of Basic Theatre Infrastructure

The cost of running the RYT program has increased over the years as the theatre program has increased from 2 to 6 productions annually. Production values have improved as the company sets professional standards for itself, and the program has built some basic infrastructure over the last few years and now has its own basic theatre lighting set up, audience seating riser, a wide range of props and costumes. These additional assets have meant that production values can be much higher with little additional cost per performance, as there is a lower reliance on the need to hire equipment. The majority of the funding is spent on the Artistic Director's wages.

## 3. The Active Promotion of RYT Performances

The RYT has traditionally put on performances that have been watched by friends and family. With the use of a national ticketing website (Stickytickets.com.au) and the increased promotion of the shows, a greater number of audience members are attending performances. This result showcases the credibility and reputation that the RYT is enjoying in gaining the support from the community. Other social media platforms such as Facebook and Twitter are regularly used to promote the performances and upcoming workshops.

## 4. Harnessing Community Support

The RYT has generated support from the wider community. Local businesses such as Eden Gardens regularly waive their facility fees to facilitate the RYT staging its performances in the amphitheatre. The RYT has been the recipients of the Mayors Community Awards (Youth Category) and has had been featured in local media stories throughout 2016.

Parents and families of participants have been very vocal in their support of the program and have used print and social media platforms to express their support for the program.



#### 5. Grant Funding

Besides the traditional arts sector funding, the RYT has been actively applying for government grant funding through various avenues. The RYT program has previously been successful in obtaining a \$26,000 grant from the "Youth Opportunities Fund", this funding was allocated towards a major theatre performance in 2014.

#### Funding Source Investigations Undertaken in 2016/17

As per Council resolution in October 2016, Council Officers undertook further investigations in an attempt to secure alternate funding sources for the Ryde Youth Theatre. These investigations focused on:

- 1. The potential to access corporate funding under the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) banner of businesses operating within Macquarie Park.
- 2. The potential to set up an independent trust to facilitate the transition to an independent status.
- 3. The exploration for funding allocation through a Community or Cultural Grant.

The results of these investigations were:

#### 1. Investigation to Access Corporate Support

- Many corporations have dedicated budgets from which they draw to fund projects aimed at achieving social outcomes. Commonly these include monetary donations and aid given to nonprofit organisations and communities. Donations are often made in areas such as the arts, education, housing, health, social welfare and the environment under the banner of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).
- Whilst the Ryde Youth Theatre can be an attractive proposition to corporations for funding under a CSR policy, it would need to develop the mechanisms by which it can be measured, evaluated and report on the outcomes of its achievements. These elements are of particular importance in order to attract corporate support.
- Corporate support can additionally be harnessed by providing a sponsorship package to businesses and the development of a sponsorship prospectus around the support of annual productions.



#### **Findings**

In 2016/17, Council Officers initiated discussions with corporate sector within Macquarie Park to seek support for the RYT. Discussions were held with Uniting Ways who coordinate the CSR agenda of 7 corporate partners including Fuji Xerox, Johnson and Johnson, Macquarie Telecom, Optus, Hyundai, Danone and Orix.

Additional discussions were held with OPTUS to explore their capacity to support the RYT program.

The feedback from these negotiations is summarised below:

**UNITING WAYS -** The corporate partners supported by Uniting Ways have already pledged their support to existing programs, such as the Dolly Parton Imagination Library, Youth employment workshops and activities at Marsden High School and as such do not have the capacity to expand their funding resources to support the RYT Program at this time. In future consideration may be given to project based funding for RYT.

**OPTUS -** Council Officers held two meetings with Optus during 2016/17, seeking OPTUS's support for the RYT. OPTUS indicated that they are currently committed to supporting a number of youth programs including 'A Digital Thumbs Up', 'Mobile Student2Student' and 'Kids Helpline digital program' which aim to support disadvantaged and vulnerable young people through technology.

Whilst OPTUS advised that funding and sponsorship of arts program is no longer their focus, they outlined their CSR priorities which include supporting vulnerable youth and indicated their willingness to work with The City of Ryde to explore other ways of offering support to RYT.

OPTUS have proposed an exploration of a fee for service model for providing corporate support aimed at:

- I. Providing performance space on the campus and allowing members of the public on to site. The logistical, insurance and security aspects of this arrangement need to be further investigated.
- II. Providing theatre experiences for employees and their families including one off performances, workshops etc. The OPTUS event team is currently assessing the potential uptake for this program from their employees.

Council Officers will continue to investigate the avenues for corporate support and a sponsorship package has been developed to offer higher visibility and value proposition to businesses, in return for their support for the RYT program.



#### **Sponsorship Packages**

Research has shown that similar theatre companies have been offering sponsorship packages to engage corporate and local business. Some examples of sponsorship packages considered were: Amateur Repertory Company Inc – ARC, Victoria; PLOS musical productions - Victoria; Shuswap Theatre – USA; Do It With Class – Young People theatre, Canada and Lakeland Community Theatre, USA.

The RYT sponsorship package **(ATTACHMENT 2)** has been developed through a review of the sponsorship packages devised by these companies and will include the following elements:

- I. Multiple levels of funding and attached benefits. The funding will begin at between \$150 to \$200 and increase to a max of approximately \$15,000.
- II. Council support in working with the businesses to offer co- branding opportunities and showcasing corporate support at premium locations in the City.
- III. All benefits with an exception of Platinum Package are provided at little or no costs to enable greater participation of the small to medium business.

#### 2. Investigation the Establishing of a Ryde Youth Theatre Trust

A trust is a legal structure where a trustee (in this case Council) holds money for the benefit of a beneficiary (the Ryde Youth Theatre). The trust is then able to directly provide services or distribute funds for charitable purposes. The Trustee maintains governance and management responsibility for the RYT. A Trust has designated gift register status as well as other tax concessions available to those contributing funds to the Trust.

Trusts governed by local Councils are not common. The previous Gosford City Council (now Central Coast Council) is the trustee of various community and environmentally focused trusts, including the Gosford Foundation Trust, Gosford Protection of the Environment Trust and Gosford Housing Trust. The Trusts had been set up to encourage and facilitate benevolent acts by individuals, families or organisations who wish to donate real estate, art or funds for public use.

#### **Findings**

Research into the effectiveness of the Gosford City Council Trusts was unable to determine any definitive answers, however, a report to the Central Coast Council on the 28 September 2016 recommended winding up the Council Trusts. To replace the Trusts, the report stated that community organisations will be encouraged to apply for grants and sponsorships from the wide range of grant support programs offered by Council. The decision of Council was deferred citing insufficient information to support the recommendation.



Anecdotal evidence suggests that because the Trusts are strongly linked with Council they are less likely to attract significant donations; with the general view being that Council should be responsible for funding the projects.

## 3. Investigation to Allocate Funds Through a Community or Cultural Grant

Council grants are allocated to locally based, not-for-profit community groups, clubs and organisations who are invited to apply for City of Ryde Community Grants.

These annual Grants are one of the ways Council supports local community groups to grow, prosper and carry out special projects that contribute to community wellbeing and help build a vibrant community culture.

Particular categories facilitating cultural outcomes for the community are:

- **Community Projects Grant |** up to \$5,000 This category funds special projects to help build a cohesive and connected community. This grant category is based on inclusion, enhanced community wellbeing and cultural growth.
- **Capacity Building Grant |** up to \$3,500 This category is for all groups to help boost growth potential. There are three Sub-Categories covering Events, Emerging & Small Groups and a General section which includes Arts and Culture.

## **Findings**

The RYT program is a Council funded program with specific outcomes attached to building cultural connections and creative skills for young people.

The existing grant categories can only support small projects due to the limited funding attached to these categories. In the absence of an incorporated status, the RYT will not be eligible to apply for a council run grants program.

The RYT could explore seeking an auspice with a larger organisation. This option was explored in the report to Council on October 2016 and resulted in the finding that there is a requirement of a 10% fee by the auspicing organisation to cover their administrative fee and additional funding is required by the auspicing organisation for the transition phase.

## The Recommended Future Direction for the Ryde Youth Theatre

The preliminary investigations into alternate sources of funding for the RYT did not reveal any satisfactory alternatives that would ensure that the RYT can continue its record of delivering beneficial programs to young people in The City of Ryde.



To allow the RYT to continue, it is recommended that Council allocate \$75,000 per annum from the General Revenue budget to fund RYT for up to four (4) years to allow for stability and additional resources to sustain the activities of the program whilst Council officers continue to explore long term options for the program.

This is in the knowledge that Federal and State arts grant arrangements can change and sponsorship opportunities can arise from time to time, Council Officers will continue to investigate alternate funding options.

Council officers will provide a report back to Council at the end of the first 2 year period in October 2019 and the Ryde Youth Theatre is to provide a report on their activities and financials to be included in Council's Annual Financial Report.

While it is possible that circumstances will change, the reality is that there may still be no alternate opportunities for funding, and a request to Council for further funding of the RYT may be recommended at that time.

## **Financial Implications**

Should Council resolve to undertake to continue funding the Ryde Youth Theatre program at \$75,000 per annum from the General Revenue budget over the next four years it will result in a financial commitment of \$300,000.

## Options

## 1. That Council discontinues Ryde Youth Theatre funding.

Council may choose not to endorse the recommendation and to discontinue the RYT funding immediately.

## 2. That Council continues to fund Ryde Youth Theatre for the next two years.

Should Council adopt this option, Council officers would continue to investigate alternate funding options.

# 3. (Preferred Option) That Council continues to fund Ryde Youth Theatre for the next four years.

The RYT provides a program that has significant benefit to young people living in the City of Ryde, and has the potential to extend these benefits into an amalgamated Council area. This is the preferred option. It is noted that at the conclusion of the recommended period that it could be quite possible that no alternate funding sources would have been found, despite Council officers continuing to investigate alternative funding options.

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

# 4 CONTINUED FUNDING FOR RYDE YOUTH THEATRE

Report prepared by: Senior Planner - Social and Cultural Planning File No.: COR2011/342 - BP16/1179

## REPORT SUMMARY

Since its inception in 2009 the Ryde Youth Theatre has worked with over 350 young people and for many, participation in the program has been life changing. Given the limited options for young people not able to participate in organised sport, the support and growth of young people provided by the Ryde Youth Theatre (RYT) and the impact this has had in the community has been a major achievement by Council.

Ryde Youth Theatre has been funded by the City of Ryde since 2009. The following table identifies the per annum budget allocation from 2009 – 2016.

Year	Funding	Year	Funding
2009/2010	\$1,600	2013/2014	\$57,147
2010/2011	\$16,705	2014/2015	\$68,221
2011/2012	\$42,000	2015/2016	\$75,000
2012/2013	\$51,212		
			Total \$311,885.00

Ryde Youth Theatre is not listed as a funded project in the 2016 – 2020 Four Year Delivery Plan and without additional funding RYT will cease operations in October this year.

Investigations have been conducted to identify alternate options with a view to seeking a long term budget solution to support Ryde Youth Theatre, however, at this time there are no viable private funding sources available.

As a result this report recommends that Council continues to fund the Ryde Youth Theatre project over the next two financial years at \$75,000 per annum. During 2016/2017 Council will continue to seek alternate sources of funding with results and recommendations reported back to Council in July 2017.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

- (a) That Council allocates the amount of \$75,000 per annum for 2016/17 and 2017/18 for the purpose of funding the Ryde Youth Theatre project to be funded from General Revenue, noting there will be a continuing search for alternate ongoing funding arrangements.
- (b) That a further report be provided to Council in July 2017 with the results of further investigations into possible alternate funding sources for the Ryde Youth Theatre project.

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

**ATTACHMENTS** 

There are no attachments for this report.

**Report Prepared By:** 

Paul Graham Senior Planner - Social and Cultural Planning

Report Approved By:

Gunjan Tripathi Senior Coordinator - Cultural and Social Planning

Dyalan Govender Acting Manager - Strategic City

Liz Coad Acting Director - City Strategy and Planning



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

## Background

In 2009 a number of local young people with the support of Ryde Youth Council approached Council staff with a request to provide a space and a small amount of funding for a youth theatre initiative. The group made the case that while there were plenty of sporting activities in the area, there were no opportunities locally for young people with an interest in theatre and performance.

Ryde Youth Theatre (RYT) was born from the initiative of that group of young people, and since that time has had a fundamental impact on the lives of the over 350 young participants that have graduated from its programs.

The impact RYT has on each generation of graduates and the reputation it has built continues to cascade through the community, the growing enrolment numbers and increasing involvement from local parents symptomatic of its power to make a difference in the lives of the young participants.

RYT is the only performing arts company of its type in the Northern Sydney region. Now under the leadership of an Artistic Director employed by Council, RYT provides opportunities for young people between the ages of 12 - 25 to join mentors and other likeminded young people to write, workshop, produce and perform their own plays.

RYT's ability to impact positively on young lives now faces a major challenge. RYT is not listed as a funded project in the 2016 – 2020 Four Year Delivery Plan. Funding from the 2015 - 2016 budget will sustain RYT until its end of year production in mid-October 2016. After that time and without additional funding RYT will cease operations.

Expenditure	Description	2015/2016
Employment costs	Part time artistic director	\$50,000
Program and workshop costs	Productions (materials, promotion, contractors, cleaning etc.)	\$25,000
Venue hire		\$15,000
		\$90,000
Income	Earned income (fees and ticket sales)	- \$15,000
Total		\$75,000

A breakdown of the 2015/2016 financial year RYT budget is provided in the table below.

Earned income from enrolment fees and ticket sales contributes to RYT budget expenditure.

Council also provides in kind support for venue hire to the value of approximately \$15,000 (calculated for the 2015/2016 financial year).



ATTACHMENT 1

Using a typical year (2015/2016) as an example, with the inclusion of the RYT funding Council's budget for activities dedicated to young people was \$127,404 (the salary for the Community Project Officer for young people is not included in the total youth activities budget).

## What does Ryde Youth Theatre achieve for local young people?

Young people aged 10-24 years make up 19.4% (or 21,075) of the total resident population of the City of Ryde (2011 ABS Census). By 2021 the youth population in the City of Ryde is expected to increase to 24,329 (i.d. Solutions, 2016). In the case of an amalgamated Council, RYT has the potential to service a greater number of young people. In 2011, young people between the ages of 10 - 25 numbered 2,661 in Hunters Hill and 5,495 in Lane Cove (ABS census).

Over 40 young people are enrolled in 2016. Staffing constraints mean RYT has no capacity to increase enrolments, and there is currently a waiting list.

As it has established itself as the only youth theatre of its type in the Northern Sydney Region, it does attract young people from other local government areas. However, in any given year 60% of the young people participating in the RYT live in the Ryde LGA.

In 2016 RYT is running twice weekly Theatre Skills Development workshops, a weekly writing workshop, one off workshops (in topics as diverse as sewing and choreography) and school holiday activities as part of overall youth theatre program. As part of annual productions, the young participants learn skills in:

- Sewing, costume design and construction
- Stage and event lighting
- Theatre directing
- Puppetry and puppet construction
- Set design
- Publicity and marketing.

Council has nurtured and made such a noteworthy financial investment in RYT. Evaluations undertaken with former and current students and also parents revealed the acquisition of a range of skills that will benefit them as they grow into young adults, and for the rest of their lives. These benefits have manifested in many former graduates going on to further theatre studies, and others finding employment in professions directly resulting from their experiences and learnings in the Theatre. Further study and employment resulting directly from participation in RYT includes:

- Director's Assistant on Channel Nine's Today Show
- Paid acting jobs
- Professional Theatre Lighting Designer
- Western Australian Academy of Performing Arts (WAAPA) widely recognised as the best actor training school in Australia



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

- Bachelor of Film at Australian Film, Television and Radio School (AFTRS) widely recognised as the best filmmaking school in Australia
- Bachelor of 3D Art and Animation
- Bachelor of Arts in Literature and Russian at the University of Melbourne
- Playwriting course at RADA

Additional to educational and vocational outcomes is the achievement of positive personal and social development attributes, precursors to important youth development outcomes like resilience, self-efficacy, personal fulfilment, and engagement in relationships and the community. These attributes included:

- Increased self-confidence and sense of identity, self-awareness and a positive sense of the future
- Increased sense of belonging through making meaningful contributions and gaining recognition from others
- Ability to be more adaptive and effectively respond to challenges, make decisions in diverse settings and taking responsibility/leading
- Being productive and self-directed in setting and striving to achieve goals, and having a positive sense of potential
- Greater peer connections leading to being respected by others and having positive feelings about being part of an organised group.

## What do the young people and parents say about Ryde Youth Theatre?

In late 2014 Council staff ran evaluations with the current students, an alumni group and parents of some of the young participants. Following are some of the responses (verbatim) from evaluations with students and parents:

"Working with and meeting people at Ryde Youth Theatre has helped by exposing me to new people, which has greatly built up my self-confidence. This has helped me feel better about myself, but it has also translated into my studies – public speaking is no longer as daunting, and as a result my marks have gone up in school, which is building my confidence and the cycle goes on".

"At Ryde Youth Theatre I have learnt great communicating skills and have found confidence on stage. I have the privilege of associating with older teenagers which has given me an insight into my future and has developed my maturity towards others. This association with older teenagers and younger teens has made me aware of my future and has greatly allowed me to learn about others' interests and how to understand others' beliefs".



## Council Reports Page 79

# **ITEM 6 (continued)**

## ATTACHMENT 1



"Ryde Youth Theatre has helped me lots in becoming a stronger and more independent person. Although I have only been here for three terms, I already can see a change within myself. I am much more confident in expressing my opinion to others, especially people older than me. Also I feel much more confident with my drama skills. My confidence within myself, that my ideas may actually work, has also grown. I feel like this confidence which RYT has given me has helped in other areas apart from drama. In areas such as SRC in school I know feel more confident in providing my ideas to senior students and the fact that it would work".

"My backstage experience, and scriptwriting, acting, marketing, designing, cooperation and teamwork experience have been really beneficial to what I fell [sic] I am capable of doing and could be doing (and looks mightily impressive on a resume)".

"The theatre classes... for year 5 students have been an amazing opportunity for my daughter. She has loved coming to each class. It has given her a lot of confidence in herself and I believe this confidence has led her to a better debater and public speaker at school. This confidence about herself has given her the strength to apply for school representative council and to our surprise she has been selected as the school captain 2014 for her school. Thank you for a lovely program and I hope it continues in the future."



## Council Reports Page 80

# **ITEM 6 (continued)**

## **ATTACHMENT 1**



"Thank you so much for the positive effect the Ryde Theatre group has had on my 14 year old daughter this year. My daughter joined the group in January, wanting to make friends outside of school and also to get involved with drama. At that time she was at a low adolescent ebb and it took quite a bit of courage to even turn up the first time not knowing anyone. Over the course of the year, and I am not overstating it, to say it has been the single most positive influence on her improvement in wellbeing".

"...I am thrilled that Ryde Council supports such an important community group - it is one way of showing families in the area... that Ryde values its young people, values their sense of belonging in the community, and supports the creative arts."

*"Firstly, I'd like to say RYT has become perhaps the most significant aspect of our children's lives during the past year. I can't imagine life without it, and I hope it continues so my children, and many others, can benefit."* 

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

## What is the impact of Ryde Youth Theatre's potential closure?

There are significant outcomes for young people and for the Ryde community as a whole resulting from participation in RYT, and there are opportunities for these benefits to be expanded in an amalgamated Council entity. Closure means that the next generation of local young people will not have the opportunity to access what RYT offers, and experience benefits like those attributed by the young people and parents that have had previous involvement with the program.

RYT has become popular with local parents. Witnessing the benefits that result from their children's' participation in RYT's programs, a number of parents volunteer for various activities and have become strong advocates for the Theatre.

# What alternate administrative and funding possibilities were considered and investigated by staff?

Staff have undertaken preliminary investigations into a number of alternate possibilities with the aim of sustaining its future in the knowledge there was no budget available beyond 2015/2016. There were five possibilities considered and investigated:

## 1. Establishing Ryde Youth Theatre as an independent legal entity

The Possibility:

- As an independent entity in the form of a not for profit incorporated organisation RYT would be eligible for both Designated Gift Recipient (DGR) and Tax Concession Charity (TCC) status. This would enable RYT to seek funding from philanthropic organisations, corporates and also increase eligibility for a greater number of government grants.
- As an independent legal entity RYT would also be in a position to identify trading activities congruent with the Company's social mission, and also provide a profitable financial return that can be channelled back into its not for profit programs. The Company would also examine how it can maximise income from its not for profit program activities, while still providing an accessible service for young people.

## Findings:

• The Australia Council for the Arts has traditionally been the body responsible for providing financial support for youth arts initiatives in the form of startup grants and multiyear foundation funding arrangements. These traditional funding opportunities have recently diminished. In May 2016 the Australia Council for the arts defunded over 60 established arts organisations, 10 of which were youth arts companies. Given the current funding environment it is highly unlikely RYT could attract the startup and ongoing foundational funding support required to establish itself as an independent legal entity.



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

- Arts NSW provides grants, however they are not directed at startup companies and RYT would not meet the eligibility criteria. Opportunities to secure the Arts NSW grants would be possible only if RYT had a foundational and established income source.
- The lack of startup funding and any ongoing foundational funding commitment from government agencies puts RYT at a disadvantage in attracting philanthropic funding/sponsorship from non-government sources.
- Government arts approaches are subject to change, and philanthropic and other non-government funding sources come on line periodically. There may be opportunities for grant/sponsorship applications/submissions in the future.

## 2. Finding and securing an auspice for Ryde Youth Theatre

The Possibility:

• As a transition stage to becoming an independent legal entity the most obvious arrangement for RYT would be under an auspice agreement. During the auspice period RYT would undertake the activities necessary to prepare it to become an independent legal entity and make applications for funding.

Findings:

- An existing budget is required. Any organisation agreeing to auspice RYT would require a fee, 10% being the industry standard. The auspice fee covers payroll, insurance and other human resource management functions.
- The auspice arrangement would assist RYT with governance responsibilities in its transition stage and lessen the immediate complexities around establishing a legal entity, however the issue of funding remains. In addition to the 10% auspice fee, RYT needs funding for its programs and other operations. In this way, the auspice arrangement has the same problem as progressing straight to legal independent entity status. It is highly unlikely that RYT would attract any startup or ongoing foundational grants from government funding agencies, and this puts it at a disadvantage when it comes to attracting philanthropic or funding from non-government sources.
- Government arts approaches are subject to change, and philanthropic and other non-government funding sources come on line periodically. There may be opportunities for grant/sponsorship applications/submissions in the future.

## 3. Merge with an existing theatre company in Hunters Hill or Lane Cove

The Possibility:

• There are community theatre groups associated with both Hunters Hill and Lane Cove local government areas.

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

Findings:

- There are no synergies between RYT and the other two theatre groups. RYT's mission is not consistent with that of the other two theatre groups.
- Neither Hunters Hill Theatre nor Lane Cove Theatre Company have any experience in the administration of a developmental theatre process, namely programs aimed at the personal and social development of young people.
- Hunters Hill and Lane Cove are community theatre groups, with no income other than tickets sales. (Hunters Hill Theatre's venue is currently being sold).

## 4. Seeking funding from government, philanthropic or corporate donors

The Possibility:

- Community organisations and 'causes' are increasingly looking to philanthropic and corporate agencies for funding. And increasingly corporates are funding projects in the community under social corporate responsibility policies.
- Government both State and Federal have a series of arts grants available for projects like RYT, and Council has been successful in securing a number.

## Findings:

- While Ryde Youth Theatre can attract sponsorship from philanthropic and/or private industry, these are only for small amounts and are project based. Contributions to local government are not attractive because they offer no tax incentive. As a project of Council, Ryde Youth Theatre cannot apply for Designated Gift Recipient (DGR) and Tax Concession Charity (TCC) status).
- 10 government funded theatre groups were defunded in 2016. While small grants are still available for projects, it is unlikely funding for operation budgets will be forthcoming unless there is a change in government policy.

## 5. Increase enrolment fees/revenue from ticket sales

The Possibility:

• RYT currently provides an affordable program for all young people in the City of Ryde. Fees are regularly increased according to CPI indexing, and provide approximately 20% of the overall budget for the operation of the Theatre. The current enrolment fees range from \$30 for a 10 week writing workshop to \$90 for an 8 session playwriting course. The theatre skills development workshops are \$65 per term (10 weeks). Increasing the fees is an option.

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

Findings:

- The Theatre will never generate sufficient revenue through enrolment fees or ticket sales to sustain its operations.
- One of the benefits of Ryde Youth Theatre is that it provides an affordable and therefore accessible option for all young people in the City. Increasing fees would impact on this benefit.

# What is the recommended future direction for Ryde Youth Theatre as a result of the investigations?

The preliminary investigations did not reveal any satisfactory alternatives that would ensure RYT can continue its record of delivering beneficial programs to young people in Ryde. To allow RYT to continue, it is recommended that Council allocate \$75,000 per annum from to general revenue to fund RYT for the next two financial years (2016/2017 and 2017/2018) for it to continue its operations.

In the knowledge that Federal and State arts grant arrangements can change and sponsorship opportunities can arise from time to time, Council staff will continue to investigate alternate funding options.

Staff will then provide a report back to Council at the end of the first 12 months on the progress of those investigations. While it is possible that circumstances will change, in reality there may still be no alternate opportunities for funding, and a request to Council for further investment in RYT may be recommended at that time.

## **Financial Implications**

Should Council resolve to undertake to continue funding the Ryde Youth Theatre project at \$75,000 per annum from general revenue over the next two financial years (2017/2017 and 2017/2018) it will result in a financial impact of \$150, 000.

## Options

## 1. That Council discontinues Ryde Youth Theatre funding

Council may choose not to endorse the recommendation and to discontinue RYT funding immediately.

This option requires consideration particularly because at the conclusion of the recommended two years continued funding at \$75,000 per annum, it is possible that no alternate funding sources would have been found. Inevitably, further requests for Council to invest in RYT will be made, and this will potentially be ongoing.

With this in mind an option would be to discontinue at this point.

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

# 2. That Council continues to fund Ryde Youth Theatre beyond the two years recommended

RYT currently provides a program that has significant benefit for all young people in the City of Ryde, and has the potential to extend these benefits for a potential amalgamated Council area. Council can be sure that the program will continue and young people participating now and in the future will continue to benefit from RYT.

Council may wish to guarantee funding RYT on an ongoing basis at \$75,000 per annum.

Should Council adopt this option, Council staff would continue to investigate alternate funding options.



## **ATTACHMENT 2**



**RYDE YOUTH THEATRE** is a theatre company for young people which was created in response to demand from young people and quickly become City of Ryde's most successful arts programme.

Responding to demand from young people and an industry gap, RYT evolved as a young writer's theatre, developing and producing scripts by young people aged 11 to 20.

Each year RYT produces short plays, written, directed and performed by young people and a large-scale production developed by a group of young writers and workshopped with our acting ensemble, for performance in October. We also produce theatre for children and "tweens" created and performed with children as young as 11. Approximately 70% of our audiences are aged under 18.

#### 2016 PROGRAM

FEB 2016	'The Tomb'	Performed to 120 people over 4 performances
MAR 2016	'Here Be Monsters'	Performed to 180 people over 6 performances
JUNE 2016	'The Doorbell'	Performed to 270 people over 9 performances
OCTOBER 2016	'Remember Me'	Performed to 150 people over 3 performances
DECEMBER 2016	'Don't Tell The Others'	Performed to 100 people over 2 performances
PROPOSED 2017 PROC	<b>FRAM</b>	
MARCH 2017	'Inside'	To be performed 9 times to up to 15 people
MAY 2017	Minor Production	To be performed 5 times to up to 30 people
JULY 2017	Underground – tbc	To be performed 9 times – venue tbc
AUGUST 2017	Young Ensemble – tbc	To be performed 3 3imes – venue tbc
OCTOBER 2017	Underground – tbc	To be performed 3 times – venue tbc
NOVEMBER 2017	Major Production – tbc	To be performed 3 times to 100 people



## Council Reports Page 87

## **ATTACHMENT 2**

### REACH

In 2016, we performed to over 800 people. In 2017, this will increase to approximately 1000 people. We have over 300 people following our facebook page and are just starting an Instagram account which has 200 followers. We have a dedicated mailing list with over xxxxx contacts.

### SPONSORSHIP PACKAGES

### SUPPORTER PACKAGE - \$250+

- 4 x complimentary tickets to the show of your choice in 2017
- Program listing as Supporter in both Major and Minor productions.
- Brand listing on sponsor board in foyer at Major and Minor productions
- On Stage mention at each performance

### SPONSOR PACKAGE - \$500+

- 4 x complimentary tickets to the Major Production / Minor Production and a show of your choice.
- Your logo on the show posters and flyers for the Major and Minor productions
- Program listing as Sponsor in both Major and Minor productions.
- Brand listing on sponsor board in foyer at Major and Minor productions
- On Stage mention at each performance

### MAJOR SPONSOR - \$1000+

- 4 x complimentary tickets to every production in the 2017 season
- · Your logo on the show posters / flyers for all productions
- Dedicated Facebook post prior to each performance.
- Half page ad in each productions program
- Brand listing on sponsor board in foyer
- On Stage mention at each performance

### PLATINUM SPONSOR - \$15,000+

- Your logo on 10 x Street Banners for 2 weeks prior to production
- 10 x complimentary tickets to every production in the 2017 season
- Your logo on the show posters / flyers for all productions
- Dedicated Facebook post prior to each performance.
- Full page ad in each productions program
- Brand listing on sponsor board in foyer
- Bespoke live advertisement, performed and written by Youth Theatre members at each performance of the Major and Minor Production.
- Possibility of performing one show in your workplace for your staff this is dependent on space available, availability of cast and staging requirements. There may be additional fees to recover extra costs.



## 7 BLENHEIM PARK - UPDATE AND STATUS - PROPERTY ACQUISITIONS

Report prepared by: Acting General Manager File No.: GRP/09/7/11 - BP17/498

## **REPORT SUMMARY**

In accordance with Council's resolution at its meeting on 26 April 2017, this report provides the history and relevant information in respect of Council's decisions relating to the acquisition of properties at 86 Blenheim Road and 12a-14 Epping Road North Ryde.

The report also details all the actions taken by Council in progressing the acquisition of the subject properties.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

That this update and status report be noted.

## ATTACHMENTS

1 Detailed Chronology - Efforts to Progress Acquisitions - 86 Blenheim Road and 12A-14 Epping Road, North Ryde (as at 12 May 2017)

Report Prepared and Approved By:

Roy Newsome Acting General Manager



# REPORT

At its meeting on 26 April 2017, in considering a Matter of Urgency, Council unanimously resolved as follows;

That following the public address by Mr Paul Azizi earlier in the meeting, that the Acting General Manager prepare a report to be presented back to Council regarding the issues raised.

As a result of this resolution, the following information is provided to Council, that addresses the history of this matter and other related matters, to detail the actions taken by Council's staff.

## **Overview of Council Decisions**

- 1. <u>Council Meeting 03/16 22 March 2016</u>
  - At this meeting, Council was considering a Planning Proposal submitted by the owners of the subject properties, to zone the site R4 High Density Residential. The Council resolved not to support the Planning Proposal proceeding to Gateway Determination. Part (b) of the resolution delegated the General Manager to investigate and action the acquisition of the land for open space, to be incorporated into Blenheim Park.
- 2. As a result of this resolution, letters dated 22 April 2016 were sent to the owners of the properties seeking to open formal negotiations with the owners to discuss the purchase of their properties on mutually agreeable terms.

Council never received a response to these letters.

 <u>Council Meeting 04/16 – 26 April 2016</u>
 Council at this meeting considered a Notice of Motion on the Expansion of Blenheim Park, to include 86 Blenheim Road and 12a -14 Epping Road North Ryde.

Council unanimously adopted this Notice of Motion with part (b) of Council's resolution stating;

- (b) That, consistent with the Council resolution of 8 March 2016, the General Manager be delegated authority to immediately proceed with the acquisition of 86 Blenheim Road and 12A-14 Epping Road, North Ryde.
- NOTE: 8 March was the Planning and Environment Committee, with Council adopting this resolution on 22 March 2016.



- 4. On the 11 June 2016, Mr P Azizi emailed all Councillors, attaching a letter from his lawyers, seeking support from Councillors of the Rescission Motion that was listed for consideration at Council's meeting on 28 June 2016. The Rescission Motion related to Council's resolution on 26 April 2016 in respect of Council's Planning Proposal to Expand Blenheim Park.
- 5. <u>Council Meeting 05/16 28 June 2016</u>

Council considered the Rescission Motion of Council's resolution from the Council meeting on 26 April 2016, relating to Council's Planning Proposal to expand Blenheim Park, through the acquisition of the subject properties.

The Rescission Motion was LOST on a unanimous vote.

6. <u>Council Meeting 06/16 – 26 July 2016</u>

At this meeting, Council considered a Late Precis of Correspondence on Council's Planning Proposal for Blenheim Park. Council was in receipt of a letter from the Department of Planning and Environment that was responding to the lodgement of Council's Planning Proposal. This letter advised that Council's Planning Proposal would not be progressed until the Department had assessed and determined the owners Pre-Gateway Review Application.

Council's resolution on this matter reconfirmed its opposition to the owner's Planning Proposal.

It should be noted that Council was then advised by the Department of Planning and Environment on 10 October 2016, that the Department had determined that the owner's Planning Proposal should not be submitted for a Gateway Determination.

The above matters all had an impact in progressing the discussions / negotiations in respect of the property acquisitions.

## Summary of Council's Actions in Respect of the Acquisition of the Subject Properties

Council attempted to commence negotiations with the owners of the properties in its letters to the Azizis', dated 22 April 2016. Council never received a response to these letters.

As a result of Council's determination of the Rescission Motion at its meeting on 28 June 2016 relating to Council's Planning Proposal to Expand Blenheim Park and the advice from the Department of Planning received on 10 October 2016, that the owner's Planning Proposal should not be submitted for Gateway Determination, Council staff then recommenced its attempts to progress the acquisition of the respective properties.



The Acting General Manager instructed Council's Lawyers Bartier Perry, to make continued efforts to progress the acquisition of the properties. The dates of these interactions are listed below;

- 12 October 2016
- 22 November 2016
- 1 February 2017
- 2 February 2017
- 15 February 2017
- 17 March 2017

A more detailed description of each request is listed in the chronology in **ATTACHMENT 1** to this report.

On each occasion up to 3 April 2017, Council was advised that the owners were awaiting the valuation for their properties.

Following the Council meeting on 28 March 2017, which considered Council's own Planning Proposal for Blenheim Park to be placed on Public Exhibition, the Acting General Manager contacted Mr Patrick Azizi to encourage the owners to confirm a meeting time to discuss the property acquisitions.

As a result, the parties initially met on this matter on 20 April 2017. These discussions were intended to seek an agreed acquisition by negotiation. Council was seeking for the parties to agree on the methodology of the valuation for the properties.

However, as there was no agreement to discuss the valuation methodology, Council has subsequently advised the owners' lawyers that it expects to receive its valuation of the properties by 19 May 2017. Council is expecting to be in a position to meet with the owners in the week commencing 22 May 2017 in order to progress with the acquisition of the properties.

On 10 May 2017, both Mr Raymond Azizi and Mr Patrick Azizi contacted various staff within the City of Ryde, being abusive and swearing at staff, which was highly inappropriate and unacceptable. The Acting General Manager then individually addressed this with both the owners and advised that such language would not be tolerated and they were to direct all enquiries through their lawyers.

CHRONOLOGY OF EMAIL CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN BARTIER PERRY AND MADISON MARCUS

Email	Date	Sender	Recipient	Purpose of email	
	22 April 2016	City of Ryde	Mr P Azizi	Initial letter sent to Mr P Azizi from Council, requesting a meeting to commence discussion in Council's acquisition of the property – 12a and 14 Epping Road.	
	22 April 2016	City of Ryde	Mr R B Azizi	Initial letter sent to Mr R B Azizi from Council, requesting a meeting to commence discussion in Council's acquisition of the property - 86 Blenheim Road.	
1.	12 October 2016	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Peter asked Paul if the landowners agree to negotiate a sale to Council	
2.	14 October 2016	Paul Jayne	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul told Peter that he was seeking instructions and would reply.	
3.	22 November 2016	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Peter asked Paul when he would let us know his clients' instructions	
4.	22 November 2016	Paul Jayne	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul replied that he had met his clients on 22 November 2016 and would be organising a valuation in the near future to begin negotiations with Council and asked Peter for Council's timetable for the acquisition process.	
5.	1 February 2017	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Peter wrote to Paul requesting a meeting with the landowners to discuss the acquisitions and enquired about the progress of the valuation.	
6.	1 February 2017	Paul Jayne	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul replied that the valuation was at a preliminary stage and said that the landowners would not proceed with the valuation until they had obtained and reviewed the documents requested in the GIPA Act application which they lodged with Council.	

Page 1 of 5

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

ITEM 7 (continued)

CHRONOLOGY OF EMAIL CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN BARTIER PERRY AND MADISON MARCUS

Email	Date	Sender	Recipient	Purpose of email
7.	2 February 2017	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Peter informed Paul of Council's request for a meeting with the landowners and asked for meeting times.
8.	15 February 2017	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Peter followed up Paul asking what times suited the landowners to meet with Council to discuss the acquisition.
9.	15 February 2017	Paul Jayne	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul told Peter that the landowners do not want to meet with Council before they obtain their valuation and said that they did not expect to receive the valuation before mid-March.
10.	17 March 2017	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Peter asked Paul if the landowners had obtained the valuation and if they were available to meet with Council.
11.	17 March 2017	Paul Jayne	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul told Peter that because of the infrastructure works occurring in the Sydney Basin, the valuation was delayed and that he hoped to receive it by the end of the March.
12.	3 April 2017	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Peter followed up Paul asking for an update on the status of the valuation report he was obtaining from Peter Dempsey.
13.	3 April 2017	Paul Jayne	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul replied to Peter's email advising that they expected the valuation report that day and would be in contact in the next few days to arrange a meeting.
14.	5 April 2017	Paul Jayne	Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Paul advised that his clients would be available to meet with Council on Tuesday 18 April 2017 or Wednesday 19 April 2017.

Page 2 of 5

Agenda of the Council Meeting No. 4/17, dated Tuesday 23 May 2017.

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

City of Ryde

ITEM 7 (continued)

CHRONOLOGY OF EMAIL CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN BARTIER PERRY AND MADISON MARCUS

Email	Date	Sender	Recipient	Purpose of email
15.	18 April 2017	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne	Bruno sent an email to Paul in response to a telephone call from Jonathon Ede (Madison Marcus Lawyers) as Peter Barakate commenced leave asking whether Wednesday 19 April 2017 was still suitable and he would seek instructions from Council as to whether they would be available then to meet.
16.	18 April 2017	Jonathon Ede	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry	Jonathon advised that Paul would now be available to meet anytime on Thursday 20 April 2017.
17.	18 April 2017	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry	Jonathon Ede	Bruno replied to Jonathon advising that we would get instructions and reply to him.
18.	19 April 2017	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry	Roxanne Thornton, Paul Kapetas, Glenn David, Roy Newsome (Council) Jonathon Ede	In response to Council's meeting request invitation, Bruno confirmed that either of the suggested times on Thursday 20 April 2017 would be suitable and offered to facilitate the meeting at the offices of Bartier Perry.
19.	19 April 2017	Jonathon Ede	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry Roxanne Thornton, Paul Kapetas, Glenn David, Roy Newsome (Council)	In response to Council's meeting request invitation, Jonathon confirmed that the morning time (9:30am to 10:30am) was their preference.

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

City of Ryde

Page 3 of 5

CHRONOLOGY OF EMAIL CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN BARTIER PERRY AND MADISON MARCUS

Email	Date	Sender	Recipient	Purpose of email
20.	19 April 2017	Roxanne Thornton	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry Paul Kapetas, Glenn David, Roy Newsome (Council) Jonathon Ede	Council confirmed meeting at 9:30am on Thursday 20 April 2017 at Council's offices.
21.	28 April 2017	Paul Jayne	Bruno Confalone and Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	<ul> <li>Letter sent by email to Bartier Perry (copy attached). The letter sets out a number of matters but in summary states (in paragraph 11) as follows:</li> <li>a professional planning consultant was engaged to determine the highest and best use of the Property;</li> <li>that planning advice concluded that the owners would have had good prospects of securing an up-zoning for the Property, but for the actions of Council;</li> <li>that up-zoning would have permitted multi-storey development, with increases in height and FSR controls.</li> </ul>
22.	2 May 2017	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne and Jonathon Ede Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Bruno replied to Paul Jayne's email confirming receipt of their letter and that instructions would be obtained.

ATTACHMENT 1

Council Reports Page 95

City of Ryde

ITEM 7 (continued)

Page 4 of 5

CHRONOLOGY OF EMAIL CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN BARTIER PERRY AND MADISON MARCUS

Email	Date	Sender	Recipient	Purpose of email
23.	9 May 2017	Jonathon Ede	Bruno Confalone and Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry Paul Jayne	Jonathon sent a follow-up email querying when a response to their letter of 28 April 2017 can be expected.
24.	10 May 2017	Bruno Confalone, Bartier Perry	Paul Jayne and Jonathon Ede Peter Barakate, Bartier Perry	Bruno sent an email to Jonathon confirming that Council expects to receive its valuation on 19 May 2017 and should be in a position to meet the following week. Bruno also advised Jonathon that a telephone call was received from Raymond Azizi (their client) on 10 May 2017 and Bruno had advised Raymond that he was unable to discuss the matter directly with him and that he should direct all communications to his solicitors.

**ATTACHMENT 1** 

City of Ryde Lifestyle and opportunity @your doorstep ITEM 7 (continued)

Page 5 of 5



# PRECIS OF CORRESPONDENCE

## 1 EASTWOOD COMMUTER CARPARK

**Report prepared by:** Executive Assistant - Mayor and Councillors **File No.:** MYR/07/10/7 - BP17/474

## **CORRESPONDENCE:**

Submitting correspondence from Transport for NSW, dated 28 April 2017, regarding Eastwood Commuter Carpark.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

That the correspondence be received and the information noted.

## ATTACHMENTS

1 Letter from Transport for NSW dated 28 April 2017 regarding Eastwood Commuter Carpark

Report Prepared By:

Linda Smith Executive Assistant - Mayor and Councillors

Report Approved By:

Amanda Janvrin Senior Coordinator - Governance

Steven Kludass Acting Director - Corporate and Organisational Support Services



## **ATTACHMENT 1**



28 April 2017

5651027v1

Clr Bill Pickering Mayor City of Ryde Council Locked Bag 2069 NORTH RYDE NSW 1670

Dear Mr. Pickering

#### Re: Eastwood Commuter Car Park - consideration of locations

Thank you for your letter dated 5 April 2017, advising me about Council's resolutions and support for consultation to gather feedback on two locations including:

- an at grade car park on the lower oval of Eastwood Park with a multi-use synthetic surface constructed above
- · a six-storey car park on West Parade in the immediate vicinity of the station

I acknowledge your request to consider the inclusion of an enhanced library as part of the car park design on the lower oval of Eastwood Park. Transport for NSW is currently assessing the viability of this element including construction feasibility, costs and planning considerations.

As you are aware we have started community engagement with consultation closing on 7 May 2017. We have been receiving detailed and quality feedback and have received 104 feedback submissions from the community to date. Key issues identified during this process include the need for better pedestrian and traffic management, visual amenity and the importance of open space. We will provide a submission report to you after submission data has been analysed.

If you have any further questions, Jane Mulroney, Senior Manager Community Engagement, would be pleased to take your call on (02) 9422 0597.

Yours sincerely Pele Church

Executive Director Precipits and Infrastructure

Transport for N5W Level 5, Tower A, Zenith Centre, 821-823 Pacific Highway, Chatswood NSW 2067 Locked Bag 6501, St Leonards NSW 2065 T 02 9200 0200 | F 02 9200 0290 | W transport.nsw.gov.au | ABN 18 804 239 602



## 2 AUDIT OFFICE OF NEW SOUTH WALES - INITIAL LOCAL GOVERNMENT PERFORMANCE AUDITS

**Report prepared by:** Executive Assistant - Mayor and Councillors File No.: MYR/07/10/7 - BP17/524

## CORRESPONDENCE:

Submitting correspondence from the Audit Office of New South Wales dated 27 April 2017, with regards to Initial Local Government Performance Audits and providing details of the work of this group over the next twelve months.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

That the correspondence be received and noted.

## ATTACHMENTS

1 Letter to Mayor Pickering from the Audit Office of New South Wales regarding Initial Local Government Performance Audits - 27 April 2017

Report Prepared By:

Linda Smith Executive Assistant - Mayor and Councillors

Report Approved By:

Amanda Janvrin Senior Coordinator - Governance

Steven Kludass Acting Director - Corporate and Organisational Support Services



## **ATTACHMENT 1**



Contact Audit Office Phone No 9275 7100 Our Ref Your Ref

27th April 2017

Dear Mayor Pickering

Mayor Bill Pickering

Locked Bag 2069

Council of the City of Ryde

NORTH RYDE NSW 1670

#### Initial local government performance audits

As you are aware, recent amendments to the Local Government Act 1993 have made the Auditor-General of NSW the Auditor of Local Councils in NSW. In addition to auditing Councils' annual financial statements, the new mandate provides for the conduct of "Performance Audits".

I am aware Performance Audits are a new type of audit for Local Government so the purpose of this letter is to tell you a little bit about them and my approach.

Essentially, performance audits assess whether selected activities or services are carried out efficiently, effectively and economically. The State Government has provided my Office with funding to conduct two to three Local Government performance audits annually. I have consulted with organisations like Local Government NSW and the Office of Local Government regarding topic selection.

In this first year, I have chosen to focus on the sector as a whole, rather than on any individual council. In this way I hope to improve my Office's understanding of Local Government and to work alongside you to provide some general benchmarking or improvement opportunities. My aim is to support Councils to identify good practice and to make improvements over time.

The first Performance Audit will focus on Councils' own reporting to their communities on service delivery. My Office is conducting a desk top review of reporting in Council annual reports and will select a sample of Councils to profile in more detail.

The second audit will survey fraud controls in place across Councils. And the final performance for the 2017/18 financial year will examine current shared services arrangements.

We will contact you directly if your Council is selected for more detailed examination in any audit.

I am sure it will be helpful if I publish a forward program of possible performance audits for you to provide any feedback on. Matters identified in my annual financial audits will also inform the selection of future topics, which may be a mix of sector wide or more targeted audits. Again, my officers will contact you during the early stages of any audit involving your Council.

Information regarding Performance Audits and my Office's approach to Local Government can be found at <a href="http://www.audit.nsw.gov.au/">http://www.audit.nsw.gov.au/</a>. Lalso enclose our Performance Audit Guide for Local Government for your information.

You may like to view my current program of State Government Performance Audits to get a better insight into the nature of performance auditing. You can also discuss any aspect of the audit of your Council with the Business Team Leader responsible for your Council. Contact details will be provided to your Acting General Manager in our Client Service Report.

Level 15, 1 Merganit Street, Sydney NSW 2000 1 GPO Box 12, Sydney NSW 2001 1 102 5275 7100 1 f 02 5275 7200 1 e melBeudt.mergor.eu 1 melt.new.gor.eu



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

I am looking forward to working constructively with you and your officers to carry out my obligations under the Act but to also support you in your work. If you have any questions, please feel free to email me (mail@audit.nsw.gov.au).

Please note I have also written to your Acting General Manager asking that this advice be tabled at a forthcoming council meeting.

With my best regards

a d 9-

Margaret Crawford Auditor-General of NSW



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

### PERFORMANCE AUDIT PROCESS

Once initiated, performance audits have three main stages: planning, conduct and reporting. A description of each of these stages, and the extent of our consultation with the audited council, is outlined in Table 1.

## Table 1-Performance audit stages and consultation with audited agencies

Planning	Audi commences	An audit learn is assigned and the audit is initiated, Commencement letters are issued to the General Manager, Chief Executive, responsible Ministeris, and the Treasurer. The head of each audited council and state agency nominates their liaison officers who will work with the audit team.	Commencement letters
	Scoping work	The audit team meets with council's liaison officers, and other key stakeholders, to gain an understanding of the council and activities relevant to the audit topic. The audit team develops the audit's scope and facus, including the audit objective and potential criteria. The potential audit scope is discussed with council's liaison officers.	Draft audit scope and focus
	Audil plan	<ul> <li>The audit team finalises the audit scope and develops the audit plan in consultation with council's fiaison officers. In addition to the scope and focus, the audit plan may include.</li> <li>The audit procedures, including how and what information is to be collected to answer the audit criteria</li> <li>audit fieldwork and approach, including the people and locations the audit team will visit during the audit.</li> <li>audit schedule, including consultation milestones and proposed tabling date. A draft audit plan is provided to the council's fiaison officers for feedback before being finalised. Once finalised, the audit plan and audit plan and audit plan and audit plan server being finalised. Once finalised to the Ceneral Manager.</li> </ul>	Audit plan and engagement letter
Conduct	Evidence gathering and analysis Preliminary Indings	Evidence is collected and analysed against the audit criteria. The audit team must ensure they have sufficient and appropriate evidence to answer the sudit objective and criteria. Preliminary findings against the audit criteria are discussed with council's liaison officers. Additional	Interviews with relevant council staff Requests for access to documents and information
	211	relevant evidence may be requested if needed.	Preliminary findings discussed



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

 unrestricted access to all people in the council from whom it is necessary to obtain audit evidence.

#### The General Manager is also requested to advise the audit team:

- if they or their council has any knowledge of any actual, suspected or alleged intentional misstatement (such as fraud) or non-compliance with laws and regulations in relation to the audit topic
- whether there has been any internal or external reviews or audits conducted in relation to the audit topic.

#### Comply with work health and safety (WHS) and anti-discrimination laws, and harassment-free workplace policies

The Audit Office is committed to maintaining a high standard of work health and safety, and our staff are expected to treat each other and council staff with courtesy and respect.

Councils have a duty of care to Audit Office staff under the Work Health and Safety Act 2011, Regulation, Codes of Practice and recognised industry standards, as appropriate.

If the audit team fails to adhere to anti-discrimination laws or the harassment free workplace policy, the council liaison officers should advise the Assistant Auditor-General Performance Audit immediately.

The Audit Office has policies and strategies to prevent and deal with discrimination and harassment.

If the audit team is treated contrary to anti-discrimination laws and the harassment free workplace policy by any council staff, the audit team will advise the Assistant Auditor-General Performance Audit immediately. The incident will be raised with the council liaison officers and, if necessary, with the General Manager and the Auditor-General.

#### Transmission of agency information

Council's may provide working papers in hard copy or electronic format. Our preferred format is electronic documents in Word, Excel, or PDF formats provided by e-mail or through the Audit Office's secure file upload service. Details of e-mail addresses to use, or the file upload service, are provided by the audit team when information is requested.

The audit team may need 'read only' access the council's electronic systems. If this is required, the liaison officer will be asked to arrange the necessary access including log in IDs or access terminals on-site.



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

Sensitive information that, in the Auditor-General's opinion, is not in the public interest will not be included in public reports. This may include commercial in confidence information. Any issues that the council may have about the Auditor-General's powers and the content of the audit report should be discussed with the audit team at the earliest opportunity.

The audit team will discuss with council's liaison officers suitable options and timing to provide information and documentation for the audit. This may include use of a web based secure file transfer facility to enable audited agencies to securely and efficiently provide requested information.

#### The audited agency's obligations

We aim to use council staff time efficiently and effectively and request the council's cooperation to facilitate our work. In the planning stage of each audit we will consult with council's liaison officers and agree on timely access to people and information (see Table 1).

#### Nominate up to two liaison officers

Council's General Manager is asked to nominate up to two liaison officers to work with the audit team. The liaison officers' role is important to both the Audit Office and council.

The liaison officer should be a senior member of the council who will keep the General Manager informed of the progress of the audit, and who has authority to make decisions on behalf of the council, for example, when reviewing the draft audit report and discussing potential audit recommendations.

The liaison officer will be asked to assist with the day to day administration of the audit, such as assistance in arranging meetings, access to people and information. Council's General Manager, or the nominated liaison officer, may wish to appoint a second liaison officer to assist the audit team with these matters.

Regular and open communications between the audit team and management of the council help deliver an efficient audit. The audit team will contact the nominated liaison officers regularly during the audit and will direct most questions and documentation requests through them. Refer to Table 1 for more details.

It is essential the audit team receives prompt responses to its questions and requests for supporting documentation.

#### Prepare early for the audit

The letter sent to the General Manager when a performance audit commences includes an indication of the issues that the performance audit will examine. This is discussed and refined during the planning phase of the audit outlined in Table 1.

The General Manager can prepare early for the performance audit by:

- reviewing relevant plans, records and source data, and making sure these are up-to-date and available for the audit team
- gathering documentation on how council monitors and measures the effectiveness, economy and efficiency of the audited activity and have the most recent results ready.

#### Provide full and free access to people and information

The General Manager and council's nominated liaison officers are responsible for arranging unrestricted access for the audit team to relevant individuals and documents and for the completeness and accuracy of the information supplied for the audit.

This is particularly important for performance audits. Each performance audit is unique and, as a result, it is difficult for audit teams to know exactly the documentation relevant to the audit. It is therefore the council's responsibility to ensure it provides.

- all information it is aware of that is relevant to the audit, whether or not it is specifically requested
- all information the audit team requests that is relevant to the audit



### **ATTACHMENT 1**

#### FOLLOW-UP PROCESS AFTER THE PERFORMANCE AUDIT IS COMPLETED

Approximately 12 months after each performance audit report is tabled in Parliament, the Public Accounts Committee (the Committee) may follow up action taken by audited agencies in response to recommendations made by the Auditor-General. As part of the follow up process, the Committee questions agencies about their response to the recommendations and, if required, conducts public hearings to examine witnesses. The Auditor-General also provides comments on submissions made by agencies to the Committee.

After the performance audit report is tabled, we write to the head of each audited agency to confirm this process and provide a template to assist the audited agency to report to the Committee when requested.

#### ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES

#### The Audit Office's obligations

We aim to complete our work efficiently to minimise the impost on each council. The time to complete this work varies depending on the complexity of the audit topic and the number of councils and state agencies that may be involved. This may range from six to 12 months.

## Knowledge of the program or activity being audited

The audit team will obtain sufficient knowledge to enable it to identify and understand issues relevant to the program or activity being audited.

Performance audits may be undertaken on topics that require specialised skills and knowledge beyond those possessed by the audit team. In these cases, we engage consultants to provide expert assistance to the audit team and will discuss this with the audited council. The audit team must ensure that any consultant engaged for the audit has the necessary competence, capabilities and impartiality to complete the work required.

#### No surprises approach

The audit team seeks to establish a constructive relationship with each council so that there are 'no surprises' in the final audit report. The audit team will explain the audit process at commencement and will maintain appropriate communication throughout the audit. Council's General Manager, and executive staff, are encouraged to provide input at appropriate stages of the audit, such as when the audit is being scoped, and when preliminary findings, the draft report and potential recommendations are discussed.

Our audit process outlined in Table 1 provides several formal consultation points for the council to discuss the audit planning, preliminary findings and draft report during the course of the audit. In practice, there is ongoing and frequent communication between the audit team and the liaison officers.

Additionally, the head of the audited council and council executive staff can contact the Auditor General, Deputy Auditor General or Assistant Auditor-General Performance Audit at any time to discuss the audit. Our contact details are provided to the General Manager and council liaison officers at the commencement of the audit.

#### Audit methodology

Our performance audit methodology is designed to satisfy Australian Audit Standards ASAE 3000 and 3500 on performance auditing. The Standards require the audit team to comply with relevant ethical requirements and plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance and draw a conclusion on the audit objective. Our processes have also been designed to comply with the performance audit requirements specified in the Act.

#### Security of agency information

The Audit Office treats all audit-related information as 'in-confidence'. Our computer network has appropriate security measures in place to mitigate unlawful access. Secure arrangements are also in place to store physical documentation.



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

#### SUMMARY OF KEY POINTS

In conducting a performance audit, the Audit Office is responsible for:

- obtaining sufficient knowledge of the program or activity being audited.
- maintaining a constructive relationship with the audited agency and undertaking adequate consultation (see Table 1)
- securing and keeping confidential all agency information obtained in the course of the audit.

The head of the audited agency is responsible for:

- nominating up to two suitable liaison officers to work with the audit team
- providing full and free access to people and information within requested timeframes. This
  includes providing all information that is relevant to the audit, even if not specifically requested.
- a duty of care to the audit team under WHS and anti-discrimination laws, and harassment free workplace policies.

#### Performance audits and topic selection

Performance audits assess whether an agency is carrying out its activities effectively, and doing so economically and efficiently and in compliance with all relevant laws. Activities examined by a performance audit may include an individual program or service provided by an individual or group of council's, all or part of an individual council, or it may consider particular issues affecting the sector as a whole and may include state agencies as well as council's. Performance audits cannot question the merits of government or council's policy objectives. The Act gives the Auditor-General authority to select performance audit topics and activities to review. We use a strategic approach to selecting performance audits, which balances our performance audit program to reflect issues of interest to Partiament and the community. We include topics that align with the government's policy objectives and reform agenda to assess progress and impacts.

Each year, the Auditor-General seeks input from the heads of government agencies and certain statutory officers, on proposed topics before publishing the performance audit program. The Auditor-General will also take into account performance audit topic suggestions from the Public Accounts Committee, Members of Parliament, local councils and members of the public.

#### Authority to access Council information

The Act provides the Audit Office with full access to information irrespective of any agency obligations for confidentiality. This overrides any other legislation that might restrict disclosure, such as secrecy or privacy laws.

The Auditor-General is entitled at all reasonable times to full and free access to information requested of the audited agency.

The only exception to this access is information that is Cabinet information as defined in the Government Information (Public Access) Act 2009 (GIPA Act). However, as a matter of convention the Secretary, Department of Premier and Gabinet, provides relevant Cabinet documents to the Auditor-General when requested.

Agencies must provide the Audit Office with information requested.

#### Confidentiality requirements

Under the PF&A Act, any information obtained in the course of undertaking a performance audit must not be disclosed by Audit Office staff to any person other than staff of the auditee, with the exception of information relating to improper conduct as detailed in the Act.

All information that the Audit Office receives, and working papers that the Audit Office creates during an audit, are exempt from the GIPA Act.



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

#### PERFORMANCE AUDIT GUIDE FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT

#### INTRODUCTION

Performance audits assess whether an agency or council is carrying out its activities effectively, and doing so economically and efficiently and in compliance with relevant laws.

This Guide provides councils (the audited agency) with information about the NSW Audit Office's performance audit process. The Guide outlines the legislative framework and the NSW Auditor-General's authority, and what to expect of the Audit Office during a performance audit.

The Guide also informs councils of their obligations to assist the performance audit team to effectively and efficiently complete their work.

#### LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

#### Auditor-General's authority to conduct performance audits

The Public Finance and Audit Act 1983 (PF&A Act) sets out the Auditor-General's functions, mandate and powers.

The Auditor-General's independence is assured by key provisions in the PF&A Act. Specifically, the Auditor-General:

- reports directly to NSW Parliament on audits of agency financial reports and performance.
- can only be dismissed by a resolution of both houses of the NSW Parliament
- decides on the program of work undertaken by the Audit Office
- Is appointed for a non-renewable eight year period. In addition, performance audits are funded by NSW Parliament, not the agency being audited.

Under the Local Government Amendment (Governance and Planning) Act 2016 (the Act), the Auditor-General is the auditor of all NSW councils and 'council entities' from 1 July 2016 and has the mandate to conduct performance audits.

The Act gives the Auditor-General authority to choose the topics and agencies for review, and to access required agency information.

The Auditor-General is required to report to the head of the audited agency, the responsible Minister and Treasurer on the result of a performance audit. In many cases, this will include the Office of Local Government and its Minister due to their respective roles.



## **ATTACHMENT 1**

Reporting Draft report A draft report is prepared and a meeting held with council's liaison officers to discuss their feedback. The Draft report purpose of the draft report is to give the council the opportunity to identify errors of fact or interpretation, and to provide additional relevant evidence that addresses the audit criteria. Responses received from the council Potential are carefully considered and amendments made as recommendations necessary. During this process the audit team will also discuss with council's liaison officers potential recommendations to be included in the audit report. The General Manager may wish to meet with the Auditor-General to discuss the draft audit report and recommendations before it is finalised. Final report The audit's final report is issued by the Auditor-General Final statutory report to the General Manager, Chief Executive, the responsible Minister/s, and the Treasurer, in accordance with the Local Government Act 1993. The audit report includes recommendations to improve accountability and performance. The General Manager is invited to provide a written response to the audit report and its recommendations that will be published with the audit report. The audit report is tabled in NSW Parliament and Tabled report published on the Audit web site

Agenda of the Council Meeting No. 4/17, dated Tuesday 23 May 2017.

# **NOTICES OF MOTION**

## 1 CHRISTIE PARK AMENITIES BUILDING - Councillor Roy Maggio

File Number: CLM/17/1/1/6 - BP17/460

## MOTION:

- (a) That the City of Ryde approve the naming of the Christie Park amenities building 'The Ross Iredale Building' to commemorate the 36 years of volunteer service on the Board of Gladesville Hornsby Football Association.
- (b) That the City of Ryde approve the transfer of the name 'The Ross Iredale Building' to the proposed new amenities building that will be built at Christie Park as Phase 2 of the redevelopment.

## 2 INDEPENDENT HEARING AND ASSESSMENT PANEL (IHAP) - Councillor Roy Maggio

File Number: CLM/17/1/1/6 - BP17/510

## **MOTION:**

That Council request the Acting General Manager to prepare a report into introducing an Independent Hearing and Assessment Panel (IHAP) at the City of Ryde and that this report be considered by the new Council, following their election on 9 September 2017.

## 3 STRENGTHENING PROCEDURES – INTERACTIONS BETWEEN COUNCILLORS AND DEVELOPERS - Councillor Roy Maggio

File Number: CLM/17/1/1/6 - BP17/528

## MOTION:

That the Acting General Manager prepare a report to a future Council Meeting identifying;

- What procedures are currently in place with respect to the interactions of staff and Councillors with Developers when negotiating Voluntary Planning Agreements; and
- (b) What measures can be implemented to improve these procedures in order to ensure the highest levels of probity and transparency in negotiations and finalising Voluntary Planning Agreement matters.



# **QUESTIONS BY COUNCILLORS AS PER POLICY**

## 1 QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE - Councillor Jeff Salvestro-Martin

File Number: CLM/17/1/1/10 - BP17/462

The below Questions relate to Holdmark VPA:-

Question 1:

What were the specific and critical skill sets that the lawyers engaged by City of Ryde to advise on the Holdmark VPA brought to this issue?

Question 2:

What was the name or names of the companies they were sourced from and why were 2 lawyers required when City of Ryde has an in-house lawyer?

Question 3:

How much was the legal bill for their advice on this matter?

Question 4:

What other matters has this legal company (s) advised City of Ryde on since 1 January 2015?

Question 5:

What is the total legal bill from this company (s) since 1 January 2015?