

Meeting Date: Tuesday 4 February 2014
Location: Committee Room 2, Level 5, Civic Centre, 1 Devlin Street, Ryde
Time: 5.01pm

Councillors Present: Councillors Etmekdjian (Chairperson), Chung, Laxale and Pickering.

Note: Councillor Pickering arrived at the meeting at 5.05pm and was present for consideration of Items 2, 3 and 4 only.

Apologies: Councillor Yedelian OAM.

Absent: Councillor Salvestro-Martin.

Staff Present: Group Manager – Environment and Planning, Service Unit Manager – Assessment, Acting Service Unit Manager – Environmental Health and Building, Team Leader – Assessment, Consultant Town Planner – Creative Planning Solutions, Assessment Officer – Town Planner, Assessment Officer, Senior Development Engineer, Team Leader – Strategic Planning, Heritage Officer, Business Support Coordinator – Environment and Planning and Section Manager – Governance.

DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

There were no disclosures of interest.

1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Meeting held on 3 December 2013

Note: Councillor Pickering was not present for consideration or voting on this Item.

RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Chung and Laxale)

That the Minutes of the Planning and Environment Committee 18/13, held on Tuesday 3 December 2013, be confirmed.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This is now a resolution of Council in accordance with the Committee's delegated powers.

2 20 AMIENS STREET, GLADESVILLE - LOT A DP 27326. Development Application for demolition and construction of a new part 2 / part 3 storey dwelling, pool, front fence and landscaping. LDA2013/0211.

Note: Peter Coorey (objector), Richard Sheldrake (objector), Clive Furnass (objector), Con Tsintarakis (objector), Michael DePalo (objector also representing Katherine DePalo), Farah Georges (objector representing Budawi Issac), Alec Pappas (applicant's architect) and Matthew Benson (applicant's planner) addressed the Committee in relation to this Item.

Note: Councillor Pickering arrived at the meeting at 5.05pm during public participation on this Item.

Note: An email from Buddy Isaac dated 2 February 2014 and photographs were tabled in relation to this matter and copies are ON FILE.

Note: A heritage impact report from Council's Heritage Officer dated 22 January 2014 and the Statement of Heritage Impact Report from Rappoport Pty Ltd dated September 2013 were tabled in relation to this matter and copies are ON FILE.

Note: Correspondence from Con and Christine Tsintarakis dated 4 February 2014 was tabled in relation to this matter and a copy is ON FILE.

MOTION: (Moved by Councillors Chung and Pickering)

That LDA2013/0211 at 20 Amiens Street, Gladesville be deferred to allow the applicant to submit amended plans to address the third storey non-compliance with Council policy, with the plans to be re-notified to all objectors and adjoining owners and a further report be prepared for referral to the Planning and Environment Committee as soon as practicable.

AMENDMENT: (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Pickering)

- (a) That LDA2013/0211 at 20 Amiens Street, Gladesville being LOT A DP 27326 be approved subject to the **ATTACHED** conditions (**Attachment 1**):
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Amendment was three (3) votes For and one (1) vote Against. The Amendment then became the Motion.

Record of Voting:

For the Amendment: Councillors Etmekdjian, Laxale and Pickering

Against the Amendment: Councillor Chung

RECOMMENDATION: (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Pickering)

- (a) That LDA2013/0211 at 20 Amiens Street, Gladesville being LOT A DP 27326 be approved subject to the **ATTACHED** conditions (**Attachment 1**):
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Councillors Etmekdjian, Laxale and Pickering

Against the Motion: Councillor Chung

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **11 FEBRUARY 2014** as dissenting votes were recorded.

3 78-80 WINBOURNE STREET EAST, WEST RYDE. LOT 19 & 20 DP 28855. Multi dwelling housing: 6 units - 2 x two storey units at the front (1 x 3 and 1 x 4 bedroom) and 4 x single storey 3 bedroom units at the rear & strata subdivision - LDA2013/0222.

Note: Peter Hall (applicant's architect) and John Boumerhe (applicant) addressed the Committee in relation to this Item.

Note: Correspondence from Peter Hall Architects Pty Ltd dated 4 February 2014, photographs and maps were tabled in relation to this matter and copies are ON FILE.

RECOMMENDATION: (Moved by Councillors Chung and Laxale)

- (a) That Local Development Application No. 2013/222 at 78-80 Winbourne Street East, West Ryde being LOT 19 and 20 DP 28855 be deferred to enable the applicant to submit amended plans including reducing the number of villas and also to address recommended reasons for refusal identified in the assessment report, namely:
 - 1. The proposal does not comply with Council's DCP 2010 – Part 3.5 Multi Dwelling Housing (attached), in particular the controls regarding, Non-preferred location – Slope of site, Solar access, Landscaping – pervious area, Side and Rear setbacks, Visual and Acoustic Privacy, Streetscape – internal driveway width and garage dominance (unit 1) and internal setbacks.
 - 2. The proposal will have unacceptable impacts on adjoining properties in terms of visual privacy, and the proposed methods of addressing these impacts will cause unacceptable amenity impacts.

3. The proposal as submitted is unsatisfactory in terms of solar access and overshadowing, in relation to impacts both on the courtyards of units 5 and 6 within the development, and also impacts on the adjoining development at No 76 Winbourne Street to the south. As a result, there will be poor levels of amenity to the occupants of both this development and the adjoining development.
 4. The proposal as submitted is unsatisfactory in terms of vehicle access and manoeuvring, particularly from the car spaces for units 3, 4 and 5.
 5. The proposal as submitted is unsatisfactory in terms of the design of the driveway, which causes adverse visual impacts associated with the extent of hard-paving near the front of the site.
 6. Objections received from adjoining owners.
- (b) That the amended plans be re-notified to all objectors and adjoining owners. If no further submissions are received, the application can be dealt with under delegation of the Group Manager - Environment and Planning. Alternatively, if submissions are received, a further report be referred to the Planning and Environment Committee as soon as practicable.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **11 FEBRUARY 2014** as substantive changes were made to the published recommendation.

4 94 ADELAIDE STREET, MEADOWBANK. LOT 5 DP 9072. Local Development Application for a new 1.5m high front fence and retaining walls. LDA2013/0391.

Note: Peter Nash (objector on behalf of Ron and Beryl Nash) and James Sia (applicant) addressed the Committee in relation to this Item.

Note: Correspondence from Ron and Beryl Nash dated 2 February 2014 and photographs were tabled in relation to this matter and copies are ON FILE.

RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Laxale and Pickering)

- (a) That Local Development Application No. LDA2013/0391 at 94 Adelaide Street, Meadowbank being LOT 5 DP 9072 be approved subject to conditions of consent contained in **ATTACHMENT 1**.
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This is now a resolution of Council in accordance with the Committee's delegated powers.

The meeting closed at 6.48pm.

CONFIRMED THIS 18TH DAY OF FEBRUARY 2014.

Chairperson