

22 April 2022

Lu Liao
Senior Designer / Team Leader
The Carton Factory, Suite 21 / 47-55 John St,
Leichhardt NSW 2040
By email: lu@ghazia.com

Dear Lu

**Urban Design Support for Amended Plans for LEC Appeal 2021/00298687
GHAZI AL ALI ARCHITECT PTY LTD v City of Ryde Council**

I refer to the above proceedings for which I am engaged to provide evidence as an expert.

I confirm that I have read Division 2 of Part 31 of the Uniform Civil Procedure Rules and the Expert Witness Code of Conduct in Schedule 7 of the Uniform Civil Procedure Rules and agree to be bound by the Code of Conduct.

I have reviewed the urban design aspects of the revised architectural design, as detailed on architectural drawings Issue C. The key changes in urban design terms are:

1. introducing a rooftop communal open space area on the west half of the rear of the two tower forms (created by converting space that had previously been assigned to five boarding rooms on western half of the top floor, while retaining the five rooms on the eastern half of that floor).
2. redesigning the communal open space at the ground level landscaping and design so as to discourage gatherings of larger groups (which might have given rise to acoustic impacts) while increasing the overall area, and to improve the visual privacy amenity for ground floor rooms facing into this space
3. relocating the garbage store from the ground floor into the basement.

In my view, the changes result in an overall improvement and raise no new issues in urban design terms for reasons including:

- At the ground floor frontage, the space formerly occupied by the garbage store has been replaced by rooms and other more appropriate activating uses, and its relocation to the basement will reduce the potential impacts of the bins away from the public domain
- At the ground floor communal space, the new landscaping treatments program the space such that large groups are unlikely to use the space, effectively managing potential acoustic impacts from the space - it has a set

of furniture and landscaping that will facilitate the use of the space by smaller groups. In addition, a planting buffer has been added in front of the windows of ground floor rooms looking onto this space, effectively screening these rooms from visual privacy impacts arising from the communal space while still providing for an attractive landscaped outlook for these rooms.

- At the rooftop, the inclusion of a second communal open space, one with excellent solar access, will increase the overall amenity of the development for residents by providing a choice of spaces for communal use, each with different characters that will support different uses and lifestyle choices for residents (e.g. quieter cooler spaces for passive recreation, sunnier spaces for small groups). The new rooftop space has been designed to minimise its potential impacts on neighbours including its deep planter edges that will prevent overlooking of adjacent properties by managing sightlines from the communal space and help to manage acoustic impacts.

I also note that the interface of the adjacent properties to the rear of the subject site is configured to have for the most part increased rear setbacks used for car parking, and so I consider that this location for the rooftop space will have the fewest impacts compared to alternative rooftop locations.

Overall I consider that the changes result in an overall improvement in urban design terms, and I recommend them to Council and the Court for favourable consideration.

Yours faithfully



Alan Cadogan
Director, Urbananc