

Meeting Date: Tuesday 18 March 2014
Location: Committee Room 2, Level 5, Civic Centre, 1 Devlin Street, Ryde
Time: 5.00pm

Councillors Present: Councillors Etmekdjian (Chairperson), Chung, Laxale, Pickering and Yedelian OAM.

Absent: Councillor Salvestro-Martin.

Staff Present: Group Manager – Environment and Planning, Service Unit Manager – Assessment, Acting Service Unit Manager – Environmental Health and Building, Team Leader – Assessment, Team Leader - Strategic Planning, Senior Development Engineer, Assessment Officer – Town Planner, Planning Consultant – Creative Planning Solutions, Business Support Coordinator – Environment and Planning, Section Manager – Governance and Meeting Support Coordinator.

DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

There were no disclosures of interest.

1 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES - Meeting held on 4 March 2014

RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Chung and Pickering)

That the Minutes of the Planning and Environment Committee 3/14, held on Tuesday 4 March 2014, be confirmed.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This is now a resolution of Council in accordance with the Committee's delegated powers.

2 8 CALLAGHAN STREET, RYDE. LOT 2 DP 35626. Local Development Application for alterations and additions to existing multi unit residential building and change of use to 5 bedroom boarding house. LDA2013/0392.

Note: Stephan John (objector), Marise Cleary (objector) and Van Nguyen (applicant) addressed the Committee in relation to this Item.

Note: A series of photographs were circulated by Stephan John in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.

Note: A series of photographs were circulated by Marise Cleary in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.

Note: A document was circulated by Van Nguyen in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.

RESOLUTION: (Moved by Councillors Yedelian OAM and Pickering)

- (a) That Local Development Application No. 2013/392 at 8 Callaghan Street, Ryde being LOT 2 DP 35626 be refused for the following reasons:
1. The proposal will result in increased adverse amenity impacts upon neighbouring properties.
 2. The proposal does not comply with Council's DCP 2010 – Part 3.6 Boarding Houses in particular the controls regarding Visual and Acoustic Privacy and Internal Building Design – location and design of communal spaces
 3. The Boarding House is inconsistent with the desired future character of the local area. In particular, the proposal involves maintaining and extending an older-style building, and it is undesirable and inconsistent with the desired future character of the area to allow a development that would prolong the life of this existing building and its intensification by approval of an additional self-contained unit.
 4. The proposal has a poor internal design (in particular the communal living room cannot be accessed internally from the existing or proposed self-contained units) which will result in a poor level of amenity for the occupants of the development.
 5. The Plan of Management is unsatisfactory and does not comply with the DCP nor address the existing amenity impacts which the existing multiple occupancy building exhibits.
 6. A valid BASIX certificate has not been provided.
 7. In the circumstances of the case, approval of the development is not in the public interest.
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: This is now a resolution of Council in accordance with the Committee's delegated powers.

3 20 AMIENS STREET, GLADESVILLE - LOT A DP27326. Development Application for Demolition and Construction of a New Part 2 / Part 3 Storey Dwelling, Pool, Front Fence and Landscaping. LDA2013/0211.

Note: Carol Sheldrake (objector), Brian Kerle (objector), Jennifer Hill (on behalf of Katherine and Micheal De Palo - objectors), Micheal De Palo (on behalf of Mr and Mrs Tsintarakis - objectors), Clive Furnass (objector) and Graham Perry (owner) addressed the Committee in relation to this Item.

Note: A document was circulated by Carol Sheldrake in relation to this Item and a copy is ON FILE.

MOTION: (Moved by Councillors Pickering and Laxale)

- (a) That LDA2013/0211 at 20 Amiens Street, Gladesville being LOT A DP27326 be approved subject to the **ATTACHED** (Attachment 1) conditions.
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

AMENDMENT: (Moved by Councillors Chung and Yedelian OAM)

- (a) That LDA2013/0211 at 20 Amiens Street, Gladesville being LOT A DP27326 be deferred to allow further consultation and mediation with the applicant and objectors and a further report be prepared for referral to the Planning and Environment Committee as soon as practicable.
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

On being put to the Meeting, the voting on the Amendment was two (2) votes For and three (3) votes Against. The Amendment was **LOST**. The Motion was then put and **CARRIED**.

Record of Voting:

For the Amendment: Councillors Chung and Yedelian OAM

Against the Amendment: Councillors Etmekdjian, Laxale and Pickering

RECOMMENDATION: (Moved by Councillors Pickering and Laxale)

- (a) That LDA2013/0211 at 20 Amiens Street, Gladesville being LOT A DP27326 be approved subject to the **ATTACHED** (Attachment 1) conditions.
- (b) That the persons who made submissions be advised of Council's decision.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Councillors Etmekdjian, Laxale and Pickering

Against the Motion: Councillors Chung and Yedelian OAM

Note: This matter will be dealt with at the Council Meeting to be held on **25 MARCH 2014** as dissenting votes were recorded.

The meeting closed at 6.24pm.

CONFIRMED THIS 15TH DAY OF APRIL 2014.

Chairperson